

Content Analysis of Violent Incidents in College Sports by Gender

Elizabeth Daniell Lancaster

A thesis submitted to the faculty of the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in the Department of Exercise and Sport Science (Sport Administration).

Chapel Hill  
2011

Approved by:

Barbara Osborne, Esq.

Dr. Coyte Cooper, Ph.D.

Shelley Johnson, M.A.

©2011  
Elizabeth Daniell Lancaster  
ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

## ABSTRACT

ELIZABETH DANIELL LANCASTER: Content Analysis of Violent Incidents in College Sports by Gender  
(Under the direction of Barbara Osborne)

The media's coverage of sport has primarily focused on male athletes and male sports (Bruce, 2008; Wensing & Bruce, 2003). The purpose of this study is to determine if there was a significant difference between newspaper articles published discussing a violent act in men's and women's Division I sports.

Two incidents in DI women's sports and two from DI men's sports were selected from the 2009-2010 season. These included Brandon Spikes's eye-gouge, Elizabeth Lambert's hair-pulling, Brittney Griner's punch, and Brent Metcalf's push. Two coders ran a content analysis on newspapers for four months after each incident of in-game violence. Five one-way ANOVAs were run to determine if any differences were detected. Significant differences were found between the genders for gender marking, and between Brittney Griner and Elizabeth Lambert for gender typecasting, and establishing heterosexuality. No significant differences were found between any of the athletes for infantilizing and non-sports related characteristics.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A special thank you to my advisor, Barbara Osborne, her help and guidance throughout the research and writing of this thesis helped make it a reality. But more importantly, Barbara, thank you for your endless support and encouragement throughout my time at Carolina.

I would also like to thank my committee members – Dr. Coyte Cooper and Shelley Johnson. Your expertise and advice was invaluable during this process. Without my committee, this process would have been impossible. Thank you to Helen Lancaster, my mom, for being my assistant coder. I appreciate you volunteering your time to read and code over forty articles about violence.

Finally, thank you to my family. Mom, Dad, and Edward J, you taught me to dream big and to work hard to make all my dreams a reality. I love you.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES.....	viii
---------------------	------

### Chapter

I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
INTRODUCTION.....	1
PURPOSE.....	2
RESEARCH QUESTIONS.....	2
DEFINITION OF TERMS.....	3
LIMITATIONS.....	4
DELIMITATIONS.....	4
ASSUMPTIONS.....	5
SIGNIFICANCE OF STUDY.....	5
II. REVIEW OF LITERATURE.....	6
ROLE CONGRUITY THEORY.....	6
VIOLENCE IN SPORTS.....	10
SPORTS AND THE MEDIA.....	12
CONTENT ANALYSIS.....	15
III. METHODOLOGY.....	18
SUBJECTS.....	18

INSTRUMENTATION.....	18
PROCEDURE.....	20
DATA ANALYSIS.....	21
IV. RESULTS.....	22
SUBJECTS.....	22
GENDER MARKING.....	22
ESTABLISHED HETEROSEXUALITY.....	24
GENDER TYPECASTING.....	25
INFANTILIZING.....	26
NON-SPORTS RELATED CHARACTERISTICS.....	26
V. DISCUSSION.....	28
SUMMARY.....	28
DESCRIPTIVE STATISTICS.....	28
ARTICLE TRENDS.....	30
RESEARCH QUESTION 1.....	32
RESEARCH QUESTION 2.....	33
RESEARCH QUESTION 3.....	35
RECOMMENDATIONS.....	37
FUTURE RESEARCH.....	38
APPENDIX A.....	39
CODING PROTOCOL.....	39
APPENDIX B.....	42
CODEBOOK VARIABLES.....	42

REFERENCES.....45

## LIST OF TABLES

1. Audit Bureau of Circulation Top 20 Newspapers in Circulation.....	19
2. Newspaper Comparison by Athlete.....	22
3. Gender Marking by Athlete.....	23
4. Gender Marking Pair-wise Comparison by Athlete.....	24
5. Established Heterosexuality by Athlete.....	24
6. Established Heterosexuality Pair-wise Comparison by Athlete.....	25
7. Gender Typecasting by Athlete.....	25
8. Gender Typecasting Pair-wise Comparison by Athlete.....	26
9. Infantilizing by Athlete.....	26
10. Non-Sports Related Characteristics by Athlete.....	27



## **CHAPTER I**

### **INTRODUCTION**

Sports media in the 20<sup>th</sup> century has been dominated by men (Wensing & Bruce, 2003). There has been a consistent pattern throughout the past 100 years of the media having low coverage of women's sports. While there has been a boom in female participation in sports during the past few decades, the media has been slow to reflect it (Wensing & Bruce, 2003). Historically the sports culture excluded women and revolved around male qualities including strength, power, and competition (Messner, Duncan & Jensen, 1993). Violence in sports is not a new trend and has commonly been written off as "boys being boys" (Messner, Dunbar & Hunt, 2000, p. 387). Violence in sports has become an expectation and this has led participants, as well as spectators to be desensitized to it. Now only the most alarming acts of violence during sports attract media attention (Fields, Collins & Comstock, 2007).

In late 2009, women's college soccer hit the front page of the national papers. It was not because of a team's undefeated run to a national championship, or because of a player's incredible athletic and academic accomplishments. Women's soccer was splashed on the front pages of newspapers because of hair pulling. Elizabeth Lambert, a defender for the University of New Mexico in a conference championship game, grabbed the ponytail of her Brigham Young opponent, and maliciously dragged her to the ground. Her opponent was unprepared for the attack and was not injured in spite of it. According to soccer experts,

Elizabeth Lambert in the game against Brigham Young committed violent fouls that are out of the normal expectations for the game of soccer (Foudy, 2009).

Fields, Collins, and Comstock maintain that rules are the foundation to any sport (2007). A soccer player, like any contact sport athlete, expects fouls during the run of play. Fouls occur either accidentally or intentionally and it is up to the referee to enforce the rules. In the case of Elizabeth Lambert, she only received a yellow card during the game, and it was not for the hair pulling incident. Her malicious acts were caught on film and released to the media.

In weeks following the November 7<sup>th</sup> game, Lambert and her violent play received national media attention. Multiple articles appeared in *The New York Times*, clips of her fouls were shown on ESPN's *Sports Center*, and she was interviewed on *Good Morning America*. The media and public became fascinated and horrified by the images of Lambert punching, slapping, and pulling her opponent's pony tail.

The national media had the opposite reaction than it usually does for women's sports - it covered the Elizabeth Lambert story for weeks. Is this because society still expects women to be gentler and, more cautious creatures compared to men? Does society expect female athletes to be less aggressive than their male-counter parts? Is violence in women's sports shocking to society while violence in men's sports is accepted? This study analyzes and explores the complexity of the issue.

## **Purpose**

The purpose of this study is to determine if there is a significant difference between newspaper articles published discussing an in-game violent act in men's Division I sports and a violent act in women's Division I sports.

## **Research Questions**

In order to determine if the reporting is different between in-game violence in men's and women's Division I athletics, this study's research questions include:

- 1) Is there a gender difference in the content analysis of newspaper articles between athletes who engaged in in-game violent acts in Division I sports based on: a) gender marking, b) gender typecasting, c) established heterosexuality, d) infantilizing, and e) non-sports related characteristics?
- 2) Is there a difference in the content analysis of newspaper articles between athletes of the same gender who engaged in in-game violent acts in Division I sports based on: a) gender marking, b) gender typecasting, c) established heterosexuality, d) infantilizing, and e) non-sports related characteristics?
- 3) Is there a lack of a difference found in the content analysis of newspaper articles between athletes, regardless of gender, who engaged in in-game violent acts in Division I sports based on: a) gender marking, b) gender typecasting, c) established heterosexuality, d) infantilizing, e) non-sports related characteristics?

## **Definition of Terms**

- NCAA (National Collegiate Athletic Association) – the major governing body of intercollegiate athletics.
- Division I – the most competitive and media-covered division of the NCAA.
- Content Analysis – the analysis of messages in mass communication through the coding of its content.

- In-Game Violence – often referred to as foul play; a deliberate violation of the rules of the game. It includes only the players in the games and occurs while the game is being played.
- Role Congruity Theory – the theory that genders adapt to socially constructed roles.
- Gender Marking – occurs when an event is identified by the gender participating.
- Gender Typecasting – occurs when the media discusses an athlete using traditionally gender specific traits.
- Establishing Heterosexuality – occurs when the media refers to an athlete as a sexual object or discusses an athlete in a heterosexual manner.
- Infantilizing – occurs when the media refers to an adult athlete by their first name only or as a ‘boy’, ‘young man’, ‘girl’ or ‘young woman’.
- Non-Sports Related Characteristics – occurs when the media discusses an athlete’s family, relationships, appearance and personality.
- Codebook – the basic document for content analysis; a record of all variables and the amount of times in an article a variable is coded.
- Inter-coding reliability – the degree of agreement among coders when performing a content analysis; the higher the agreement, the more reliable the data.

### **Limitations**

The study’s limitations include:

- The circulation numbers for the newspapers may not be accurate.
- Wrestling and football are both inherently violent sports; in-game violence may not be as unsettling for the media and fans and in-game violence in other, less violent-natured sports, like soccer and basketball.

### **Delimitations**

The study was limited to newspaper published in the United States. International newspapers were not coded. Newspaper articles were limited to the four months following each act of in-game violence.

### **Assumptions**

LexisNexis will have all articles that were published by newspapers accessible.

### **Significance of Study**

This study is significant to athletic departments and the media. It helps athletic departments understand how the major newspapers respond to incidences of violence in games depending on gender. This knowledge will help the athletic department, especially sports information directors, predict how newspapers will cover in-game violence, and if it matters the gender of the sport the violence occurred in. This knowledge will help sports information directors write and release appropriate public relations statements sooner. It also helps marketing departments understand how the media may portray their teams after in-game violence occurs. Marketing departments can respond faster with branding techniques and ways to change the public's image of their teams. It also helps the media understand how they report on in-game violence and if gender stereotypes significantly influence reporting.

## **CHAPTER II**

### **REVIEW OF LITERATURE**

Research focusing on organized sports began in the late 1970's and early 1980's by authors like Coakley (1978), Dubbert (1979), Bianchi (1980), Komisar (1980), and Sabo (1988). The focus of the research ranged from sports in society, masculinity and violence in sports. In the past 30 years, the research focusing on sports has branched out to include women and the media's involvement in athletics.

#### **Role Congruity Theory**

Role congruity theory revolves around the construct that genders commonly adapt to socially constructed roles, prescribed by valued behavior for men and women (Diekmann & Goodfriend, 2006; Eagly & Karau, 2002; Garcia-Retamero & López-Zafra, 2006). The members of the society expect people to abide by the social roles and desirable traits. Confusion and frustration can occur in the society when people do not adapt to their prescribed social roles (Diekmann & Eagly, 2000). Role congruity theory involves society and what are considered desirable traits and roles within that organization.

An example of social roles determined by society is employment. Throughout the generations, society has come to expect that women will take-up jobs and careers that allow them to nurture, such as, stay-at-home mothers, teachers, and nurses (Eagly & Karau, 2002). Women are expected to have natural tendencies to be care-takers. On the other hand, it is assumed that men will have jobs that require power, competition and dominance, such as builders, judges, and military officers. These jobs allow them to compete and protect

(Diekmann & Eagly, 2000). The division of labor based on gender reflects society's beliefs for what are the natural and desirable traits of men and women. When a person steps outside a socially-constructed social role, there is an outlash and confusion among their peers and that person is devalued (Diekmann & Goodfriend, 2006).

Role congruity theory is similar to social role theory. Social role theory (Eagly & Karau, 2002) represents the comprehended stereotypes people believe about their position and what roles and positions they should assume. The difference between role congruity theory and social role theory is that role congruity theory applies to how society views social roles, while social role theory applies to how individual people identify their social roles (Eagly & Karau, 2002). Social role theory is a psychological theory, while role congruity theory is sociological.

A great deal of research has been focused on role congruity theory and leadership. The belief is that society views leadership as a masculine trait (Garcia-Retamero & López-Zafra, 2006). Garcia-Retamero & López-Zafra (2006) completed a study in the south of Spain, with 705 subjects ranging from high school students, undergraduates, workers and retired adults. The individuals were given a 20-minute questionnaire and read a narrative about of a large corporation wanting to promote a male or female employee to production supervisor. The position was described in the auto manufacturing industry or the clothing manufacturing industry, or it was not specified. Participants were instructed to imagine the potential leader's characteristics and likely success as a manager, and to evaluate candidates on several issues related to the success as a production supervisor.

Participants found the potential female candidate the most likely for promotion in the clothing manufacturing industry and the male candidate the most likely for promotion in the

auto manufacturing industry as well as the unspecified industry. A significance difference also showed that participants believed the potential male candidate would be more successful in his job than the female candidate (Garcia-Retamero & López-Zafra, 2006). This study shows that society shapes our beliefs for what jobs men and women will be successful. It also shows that without previous knowledge of the job, society can lead people to believe a male candidate is better suited for a job than a female candidate. While this is not an American study and does not reflect the American societal beliefs, it does illustrate how society shapes perceptions of men's and women's job success in gender-marked industries.

Many high-powered, leadership driven careers like Fortune 500 CEOs, state senators, and the military positions of Brigade General or higher are dominated by men, yet women possess 51% of the undergraduate degrees in the US and 45% of the advanced degrees (Eagly & Karau, 2002; U.S. Bureau of the Census, 2000). There are many reasons that women are not in these leadership positions. One explanation is that many smart, eligible women opt to leave the workforce to raise a family and do not work long enough to reach positions of leadership. Another explanation is that there is also a role congruity theory prejudice toward female leaders, because female leaders tend to have different, although still effective, leadership qualities (Garcia-Retamero & López-Zafra, 2006). These qualities include collaborating with peers, gaining respect and trust by followers, and being more transformational than male counterparts (Eagly, Johannessen-Schmidt, & van Engen, 2003). This role congruity theory prejudice against women leaders shows the influence of society's beliefs. Men, trait-wise, are thought of as being stronger leaders, yet women have shown they provide a unique skill set that can allow them to be better leaders than men (Garcia-



Retamero & López-Zafra, 2006). However because society has the notion that men are better leaders, women have a difficult time getting leadership positions (Eagly et al, 2003).

There is a natural association in American society between men and sports. Society sees sports as a man's domain - an outlet for men's natural competitiveness, their strength, power and even violence (Messner et al., 1993; Messner, Dubar, & Hunt, 2000). While sports were historically more accessible among men, the enactment of Title IX in 1972 mandated that females have the opportunity to participate in athletics. In 1971, only 294,015 girls participated in high school sports, but by 1989-90, 1,858,659 girls played high school sports (Messner et al, 1993). The exponential growth of women in athletics is when Messner et al, (1993) identifies the male hegemony of sports becoming a contested ground between the genders.

Themes are consistent among our society and athletics. These include: sport is a man's domain, aggressive players win, nice guys finish last, "boys will be boys" excuse for rough and tumble play, no pain - no gain, no blood - no foul, and sport is war (Messner et al., 2000 , p. 387). The recurring themes are all based on very masculine traits. Various sports have even been labeled as masculine and feminine. Masculine sports include football, rugby, and ski jumping: these sports are rigorous, physically difficult, and violent (Daddario, 1994). Feminine labeled sports are more graceful, artful and do not include contact. Daddario (1994) identified tennis, swimming, golf, gymnastics, and figure skating as feminine sports.

Role congruity theory suggests that society objects when a female plays a masculine sport and vice versa. The challenge for females participating in athletics is to separate themselves from the masculine themes which society has associated with athletics. By

reporting on some sports but not others, the media reinforces sports as a male domain even though female participation is at all time high (Bruce, 2008).

### **Violence in Sports**

Violence in sports occurs at all levels, from the youth to the professional ranks (Conroy, Silva, Newcomer, Walker, & Johnson, 2001). Because sport violence is so common, only the most appalling and unforgivable violent acts receive media attention and outcry (Fields, Collins, & Comstock, 2007). The public has begun to accept most sport related violence, believing it is part of the game, or just 'boys being boys' (Fields et al., 2009). Fields et al. (2007) focused their attention on sport related violence and breaking violent actions into subsets. The belief was that sports violence occurred for different reasons, but it was all interconnected and an example of interpersonal violence. The focus of the study was to demonstrate how three divisions of sports violence - hazing, brawling, and foul play - also are acts of interpersonal violence. This study provides excellent examples of hazing, brawling, and foul play, and explanations of how athletes react and why the violence occurs (Fields et al., 2007).

Fields et al. (2007) described that hazing is both psychological and physical and is defended as a time-honored tradition or a way to build trust and unity among a team. Victims of hazing often become the initiators as they gain power and respect on the team (Fields et al., 2007). Hazing is a word that is often linked to athletic teams and fraternities. A survey conducted by Alfred University revealed that 35% of high school athletes surveyed admitted to being hazed or participating in the hazing of a teammate (Hoover & Pollard, 2000). NCAA varsity athletes are at an even higher risk of being hazed, with 80% of NCAA athletes reporting hazing according to the Alfred University survey. One in five respondents

was subjected to “unacceptable and potentially illegal hazing,” including beatings, kidnapping, and abandonment (Hoover, 1999). Research also indicates that there is no difference between boys’ and girls’ likelihood to haze a teammate; girls are just as likely to use physical hazing as boys (Gershel, Katz-Sidlow, Small, & Zandieh, 2003).

“Brawling” is a fight that breaks out before, during, or after a sporting event. This can happen on the court, rink field, or stands (Fields et al., 2009). The fights can incorporate players, fans, coaches, officials and parents. Brawling is more common in men’s sports (Fields et al., 2009). Sociologists argue this is because sport reflects traditionally desired masculine traits, such as aggression, dominance and courage. The pressure on male athletes to display these traits leads to overt aggression and violence that turns into brawling (Fields et al., 2007).

“Foul play” is the last form of sports related violence, according to Fields et al. (2009) and is considered a deliberate violation of the rules of the game with the intent to injure the opponent. Foul play occurs on the court, field, or rink during the game and only the players are involved. Foul play commonly leads to injury (Fields et al., 2007). This study focuses on violent acts that fall into the foul play category, and are termed ‘in-game violence’ for research purposes.

Gender differences are associated with foul play (Conroy et al., 2001). Women believe sports related violence is less acceptable, while men are far more tolerable and accepting of it (Conroy et al., 2001). Conroy et al. (2001) surveyed 1,018 children and adolescents in North Carolina public schools to assess their perceptions of the legitimacy of aggressive sports behavior. The first part of the survey was a 10-question demographic questionnaire asking questions about age, gender, race, and whether the participant currently

played any sports. For those who play, follow-up questions about which sports they had played, and how long they had played were asked.

Ten sports descriptions followed the demographic questionnaire in the Conroy et al. (2001) research study. Each of the ten descriptions had 12 questions for the scenario. The scenarios described clearly aggressive, rule-violating behavior in a variety of sports. Male and female actors in the scenarios were used when possible; when sports such as football and baseball were described, female actors were not possible. The participants had to read each scenario and answer 12 questions on an 8-point scale with four point descriptions. The 8-point scale descriptions ranged from 'Never OK' to 'Always OK'. The results from this study showed that boys and adolescent males were much more comfortable and accepting of the violent behavior (Conroy et al., 2001). This study indicates that men accept violence in sports as part of the game from a young age.

There is a belief among young athletes that overt aggression, which may lead to violence, is necessary, especially in contact and collision sports (Shields, 1999; Conroy et al., 2001). Many adolescent athletes are uncomfortable with the amount of violence in their sport, but accept it (Shields, 1999). A disturbing trend among young athletes in contact sports is that coaches evaluate not only player's technical and physical skills, but also their ability to intimidate and use violence (Shields, 1999).

### **Sports and the Media**

The mass media is a powerful industry, capable of shaping gender images and models. As Kirk (1993) states:

Media culture is not merely consumed and discarded, but is utilized to construct personal identities ... the material the media supplies is not passively absorbed, but is actively appropriated as the stuff of people's sense of self, their place in the social world, and the bases of their hopes and expectations of the future ... (p.18).

The mass media coverage of sport, including newspapers, magazines, and television throughout the past twenty years has been dominated by male sports (Bruce, 2008; Wensing & Bruce, 2003). Although research has clearly indicated that sports media is a male domain, the media has consistently ignored and rejected the research that shows the imbalance (Bruce, 2008). One media industry critiques of the research claimed it was inaccurate because researchers picked weeks in which few women's sports were played (Bruce, 2008). The sports media continues to reinforce the popular belief that sports is a male domain by focusing mainly on male sports (Bruce, 2008).

Women's sports are not entirely ignored by the sports media, but the media industry has marked the sports world as "an essentially male-skewed world...one in which females have reason to wonder about their social position and role" (Melnick & Jackson, 1998, p. 550).

Research conducted throughout the 1980's and 1990's showed that women's sports received between 4.4% and 10% of newspaper coverage compared to what the men were receiving. In 1980, Bryant conducted a two-year analysis of two major newspapers. The results of the study revealed only 4.4% of newspaper column inches were devoted to women's sports. Graydon (1983) found in 1981 and 1982, over 90% of reporting in newspapers was devoted to men's sports.

Messner et al. (1993) examined the television coverage of men and women in basketball and tennis. The coverage for basketball was the men's and women's 1989 NCAA Final Four which involved two semi-final and one championship match-up for each gender. The coverage for tennis consisted of the final four days of 1989 U.S. Open tennis tournament, which included four men's singles matches and four women's singles matches,

one men's double match, two women's double matches, and one mixed-doubles match. The television coverage of the games and matches were compared and analyzed.

One way Messner et al. (1993) compared the games and matches between the sexes was using "gender marking". An example of gender marking is distinguishing the women's event as the "Women's Final Four" while the men's tournament was simply called the "Final Four" without gender marking. It was found that the women's NCAA basketball tournament was consistently gender marked, both verbally by commentators and through visual graphics on the television. During the men's tournament, no gender marking was observed - it was never called the 'Men's Final Four. In contracts, the U.S. Open gender marked men's and women's tennis equally; matches were always specified as "men's doubles finals" or "women's singles quarterfinals" (Messner et al., 1993).

The Messner et al. (1993) study also showed that "infantilizing" occurred for the women. Female athletes were often referred to as "girls" and "young ladies", while the male athletes were never called "boys" or "young men". The last difference these authors noted was the commentators' use of different adjectives for the genders, also known as "gender typecasting". Male basketball and tennis players were "strong", "powerful", "dominant", and had a "will to win" (Messner et al., 1993, p. 130). Female athletes were cited as "smaller", "playing with naked aggression", and often times commentators claimed they were "lucky to win" (Messner et al., 1993, p. 130). Luck was never used as a reason for a male athlete's success (Messner et al., 1993). The discussion of the study states that commentators reinforce society's ideas and beliefs and social conventions.

Wensing and Bruce (2003) in their research during the 2000 Olympics broke down the unwritten rules the media used when covering women's sports. The first rule is "gender

marking”, as described in the previous study by Messner et al. (1993). This is when an event is identified as a women’s event to distinguish it when there is a similar men’s event. It implies the women’s event is inferior to the men’s, because only the women’s event is differentiated by gender (Wensing & Bruce, 2003). An example of this is calling the event the Women’s World Cup, compared to the men’s event, known as the World Cup.

The second is “established heterosexuality”, this is when the media blatantly refers to an athlete as a sexual object or discusses them in a heterosexual manner (Daddario, 1994).

The third is “gender typecasting”, when commentators focus on or emphasize appropriate traditional feminine traits, for example describing female athletes as small, beautiful, graceful, emotional, unstable, lovely, and kind . Males are type-casted as big, strong, aggressive, and dominant (Prinen, 1997).

The fourth is “infantilization”, which is when the media refers to a successful female adult athlete as a ‘girl’ or ‘young lady’ or only calling them by their first name. (Elueze & Jones, 1998).

The last unwritten rule for media is “non-sports related characteristics”. This occurs when the focus of an article or broadcast diverts from athletics and discusses family, relationships, appearance, and personality. Taking the focus away from the sport and the athletes demeans the effort and athletic skill that is demonstrated. It also reinforces the idea to consumers that the sports performance comes secondary to the other topics discussed (Weiller & Higgs, 1999). Gender marking, establishing heterosexuality, gender typecasting, infantilizing, and non-spot related characteristics are the five areas that researchers code to conduct content analysis on media sources.

## **Content Analysis**

Content analysis is the investigation of messages in mass communication (Lombard, Snyder-Duch, & Bracken, 2002). Berelson's (1952) often cited definition of content analysis is "a research technique for the objective, systematic, and quantitative description of the manifest content of communication" (p.18). This definition shows that content analysis is a unique research method. Content analysis is also based on codifying text or content of a piece of writing into selected categories based on certain criteria. After the coding, scales are created to interpret the data gathered during coding (Milne & Adler, 1999).

Content analysis is a widely used research method for analyzing how a topic is represented within the media. It is also a time-consuming research method because the researcher must examine every article or television broadcast. There can be hundreds of articles or hours of programs that a researcher must critique (Wensing & Bruce, 2003). A researcher must also work to make sure there is reliability among the research and the results.

There are two areas where reliability is involved; the first is that the data is reliable, the second is that the coding method is reliable (Milne & Adler, 1999; Lombard et al., 2002). The researcher needs to create reliability to establish the data (Lombard et al., 2002). A coding method can be considered reliable if it is interceded on a 'yes-no' scale rather than a 'sliding' scale. This is because various researchers can analyze the same data and produced the same output with a 'yes-no' scale whereas a 'sliding-scale' which can cause different researchers to assign different ratings thus producing different and inconsistent output (Lombard et al., 2002).

Over the last forty years, the focus of research involving sports has grown. A branch of that research included how women and women's sports were covered by the media. The



following research will examine how the media reacts to violence in men's and women's sports.

## **CHAPTER III**

### **METHODOLOGY**

The purpose of this study is to determine if there is a difference in newspaper content when acts of violence occur in men's and women's NCAA Division I sports. This chapter will consist of a description of the subjects, instrumentation, procedure, and data analysis.

#### **Subjects**

Four subjects, two male and two female were analyzed for this study. They included Brittney Griner, a Baylor basketball player, Brandon Spikes, a University of Florida football player, Elizabeth Lambert, a University of New Mexico soccer player, and Brent Metcalf, a University of Iowa wrestler. These NCAA Division I athletes were selected for this content analysis study because these players initiated unsportsmanlike, violent behavior during their respective games/matches during the 2009-2010 academic year. Brittney Griner punched an opposing player in the face. Brandon Spikes eye gouged an opponent. Elizabeth Lambert pulled an opposing player's ponytail and wrenched her to the ground. Brent Metcalf tackled his opponent who was doing a celebratory black flip with three seconds remaining in the match.

#### **Instrumentation**

Newspaper articles published in the United States discussing a selected athlete and their in-game violence were coded using our five markers. Articles written within four months after in-game violence for each athlete were selected and coded. International

newspapers were not coded. Articles were coded for gender marking, gender typecasting, established heterosexuality, infantilizing, non-sports related characteristics and whether the newspaper was national or local. All articles identified by the LexisNexis Academic database were included in the data set. Newspapers were considered national if they were in the top 20 in circulation. Circulation was determined by the Audit Bureau of Circulation who studied the top 100 newspapers in circulation for six months, ending on March 31, 2010. A four-month period of time was selected because that is the length of an average NCAA season. To access the newspaper articles, LexisNexis Academic accessed through the UNC Library website was used.

Table 1  
*Audit Bureau of Circulation Top 20 U.S. Newspapers*

Rank	Newspaper	City	State	Daily Circulation
1	The Wall Street Journal	New York	New York	2,092,523
2	USA Today	McLean	Virginia	1,826,622
3	The New York Times	New York	New York	951,063
4	Los Angeles Times	Los Angeles	California	616,606
5	The Washington Post	Washington	District of Columbia	578,482
6	Daily News	New York	New York	535,059
7	New York Post	New York	New York	525,004
8	San Jose Mercury News/ Contra Costa Times/ The Oakland Tribune	San Jose	California	516,701
9	Chicago Tribune	Chicago	Illinois	516,032
10	Houston Chronicle	Houston	Texas	494,131
11	The Arizona Republic	Phoenix	Arizona	433,731
12	The Philadelphia Inquirer	Philadelphia	Pennsylvania	356,189
13	Newsday	Melville	New York	334,809

14	The Denver Post	Denver	Colorado	333,675
15	Star Tribune	Minneapolis	Minnesota	295,438
16	St. Petersburg Times	St. Petersburg	Florida	278,888
17	Chicago Sun-Times	Chicago	Illinois	268,803
18	The Plain Dealer	Cleveland	Ohio	267,888
19	The Oregonian	Portland	Oregon	263,600
20	The Seattle Times	Seattle	Washington	263,468

**Procedure**

Each of the four player’s names was typed into LexisNexis Academic, in ‘Search For’ under ‘Search for News’. The ‘Source Type’ was limited to Newspapers. Once the search was executed, articles within the four-month period that discussed the athlete and their in-game violence were selected. Two sentence blubs in the “In the News” section were not selected. These sentences did not have enough content to code and were not considered articles for this research. Once all the articles were printed off from LexisNexis, training the coders on coding protocol began.

Two coders were used for this research to ensure reliability. The lead researcher acted as the primary coder and trained the assistant coder on the proper data collection protocol. The primary coder created the ‘Coding Protocol’ and ‘Codebook Variables’ documents ( see Appendix A and B for these documents). Four articles were selected, one from each athlete to train the coder. The coders read the articles together and the primary coder taught the assistant coder how to code each article for the five variables. The next step was to use four more articles, one from each athlete, with the coders coding the same articles, separately. One percent of the total articles were used for training purposes. Upon completion of independent coding, the coders compared their coding results with the Krippendorff’s  $\alpha$  equaling .87. This level of agreement is acceptable for Krippendorff’s  $\alpha$  to determine inter-reliability among coders (Milne & Adler, 1999).

Once inter-reliability among coders was established, the eighty-three remaining articles were evenly split among the two coders. The coders analyzed the content of the newspapers for gender marking, gender typecasting, establishing heterosexuality, infantilizing, and non-sport related characteristics. Each coder kept an individual codebook, which were combined once all articles were coded.

### **Data Analysis**

The compiled codebook was created in Excel and uploaded into PASW Statistics Software. The alpha level was set at .05. A one-way between-subjects ANOVA with four levels was run for each of the five independent variables to determine if there was a relationship between articles published discussing an in-game violent act in men's Division I sports and a violent act in women's Division I sports. The independent variable, content analysis, had five levels: gender marking, gender typecasting, established heterosexuality, infantilizing, and non-sport related characteristics. The dependent variable, Division I college athletes, had four levels: Brittney Griner, Elizabeth Lambert, Brandon Spikes, and Brent Metcalf.

## CHAPTER IV

### RESULTS

#### Subjects

A total of 83 articles were coded for the four athletes. Britney Griner had 32 articles written and coded about her. Thirty-seven percent of her articles were published in a national newspaper and she averaged 523 words per article. Griner's words per article ranged from 70 words to 753. Elizabeth Lambert had 17 articles written and coded. Twenty-one percent of her articles were published in a national newspaper with an average of 604 words per article. The words per article for Lambert ranged from 70 words to 1200 words. Brandon Spikes had 24 articles published and coded about him. Fourteen percent of his articles were published in a national newspaper and averaged 670 words. Spikes's words per article ranged from 194 words to 911 words. Brent Metcalf had 10 articles written and coded with only 11% of the articles being published in national newspapers. Metcalf averaged 574 words per article and his words per article ranged from 194 words to 911 words. Table 2 summarizes the descriptive statistics regarding the subjects.

Table 2  
*Newspaper Comparisons by Athlete*

Athlete	National Articles	Local Articles	Average Words Per Article	Word Range
Brittney Griner	9	24	523	70 – 753
Elizabeth Lambert	3	14	604	233 – 1200
Brandon Spikes	3	21	670	194 – 911
Brent Metcalf	1	9	574	151 – 945

Note: A "National Article" appeared in a newspaper that was in the top 20 in national circulation

An ANOVA was run to see if there was a significant difference from the athletes and the word counts of the articles. The ANOVA for word count was not statistically significant between the four athletes [ $F(3, 79) = 1.071, p = .366$ ]. Because no significant differences were found, post hoc tests were not run.

### **Gender Marking**

Gender marking showed a significant difference between at least two of the athletes [ $F(3, 79) = 13.08, p = .001$ ]. Follow-up pair-wise comparison tests using the Tukey post hoc test were conducted to evaluate pair-wise differences among the means. Of the five levels of the content analysis, only gender marking showed a significant difference between the male and female athletes. The female athletes, Brittney Griner and Elizabeth Lambert averaged over two gender markings per article, while the male athletes averaged less than one, as seen in Table 3.

Table 3  
*Gender Marking by Athlete*

Athlete	Mean	Std. Deviation
Brittney Griner	2.56	1.64
Brandon Spikes	0.08	0.41
Elizabeth Lambert	2.94	3.43
Brent Metcalf	0.10	0.32

We observed Brittney Griner was significantly different from Brandon Spikes ( $p = .00$ ) and Brent Metcalf ( $p = .00$ ). In addition, Elizabeth Lambert was significantly different from Brandon Spikes ( $p = .00$ ) and Brent Metcalf ( $p = .00$ ). There was no significant difference between Elizabeth Lambert and Brittney Griner ( $p = .91$ ) or Brent Metcalf and Brandon Spikes ( $p = 1$ ). These results can be seen in Table 4. From this analysis the null hypothesis, that there will be no difference between the genders, is rejected for gender marking.

Table 4  
*Gender Marking Pair-wise Comparison of Athletes*

Athlete (I)	Athlete (J)	<i>P</i> -value	Mean Difference (I-J)
Brittney Griner	Brandon Spikes	0.00*	2.48
Brittney Griner	Brent Metcalf	0.00*	2.46
Elizabeth Lambert	Brandon Spikes	0.00*	2.86
Elizabeth Lambert	Brent Metcalf	0.00*	2.84
Elizabeth Lambert	Brittney Griner	0.90	0.38
Brandon Spikes	Brent Metcalf	1.00	0.02

\*Indicates significant *p*-value (alpha level < .05)

### **Established Heterosexuality**

The omnibus test revealed a significant difference between at least two of the athletes for established heterosexuality [ $F(3, 79) = 3.04, p = .034$ ]. Table 5 shows that on average each athlete averaged less than one occurrence of established heterosexuality. A Tukey post hoc test was run for the pair-wise comparison.

Table 5  
*Established Heterosexuality by Athlete*

Athlete	Mean	Std. Deviation
Brittney Griner	0.00	0.00
Brandon Spikes	0.08	0.28
Elizabeth Lambert	0.53	1.33
Brent Metcalf	0.00	0.00

For established heterosexuality, we observed Brittney Griner was significantly different than Elizabeth Lambert ( $p = 0.03$ ). This was the only significant difference between the athletes, as seen in Table 6. Brittney Griner was not significantly different than Brandon Spikes ( $p = .96$ ) or Brent Metcalf ( $p = 1$ ). Brandon Spikes was not significantly different than Elizabeth Lambert ( $p = .11$ ) or Brent Metcalf ( $p = .98$ ). Brent Metcalf was not significantly different than Elizabeth Lambert ( $p = .15$ ). Table 6 summarizes the results from the pair-wise comparison. From this analysis, the null hypothesis, that there will be no difference between the athletes for established heterosexuality, is rejected for established heterosexuality.



Table 6

*Established Heterosexuality Pair-wise Comparison of the Athletes*

Athlete (I)	Athlete (J)	P-value	Mean Difference (I-J)
Brittney Griner	Brandon Spikes	0.96	-0.08
Brittney Griner	Elizabeth Lambert	0.03*	-0.53
Brittney Griner	Brent Metcalf	1.00	0.00
Brandon Spikes	Elizabeth Lambert	0.11	-0.45
Brandon Spikes	Brent Metcalf	0.98	0.08
Brent Metcalf	Elizabeth Lambert	0.15	0.53

\*Indicates significant p-value (alpha level < .05)

### Gender Typecasting

The omnibus test revealed a significant difference between at least two athletes for gender typecasting [ $F(3, 78) = 5.23, p = .002$ ]. Follow-up tests were conducted to evaluate pair-wise comparisons among the means. Post hoc comparisons were run using the Tukey test, as seen in Table 8.

Table 7

*Gender Typecasting by Athlete*

Athlete	Mean	Std. Deviation
Brittney Griner	1.32	1.64
Brandon Spikes	2.21	2.02
Elizabeth Lambert	3.76	2.59
Brent Metcalf	2.80	2.57

The Tukey Post Hoc test for gender typecasting showed a significant difference between Brittney Griner and Elizabeth Lambert ( $p = .001$ ). But there was not a significant difference between any of the other athletes, as seen in Table 8. We did not observe Brittney Griner to be significantly different from Brandon Spikes ( $p = .41$ ) or Brent Metcalf ( $p = .22$ ). Brandon Spikes was not significantly different from Elizabeth Lambert ( $p = .09$ ) or Brent Metcalf ( $p = .88$ ). Brent Metcalf was not significantly different from Elizabeth Lambert ( $p = .66$ ). Table 8 summarizes the findings from the pair-wise comparison. From this analysis,

the null hypothesis, that there will be no difference between the athletes, is rejected for gender typecasting.

Table 8  
*Gender Typecasting Pair-wise Comparison of Athletes*

Athlete (I)	Athlete (J)	P-value	Mean Difference (I-J)
Brittney Griner	Brandon Spikes	0.41	-0.89
Brittney Griner	Elizabeth Lambert	0.00*	-2.44
Brittney Griner	Brent Metcalf	0.22	-1.48
Brandon Spikes	Elizabeth Lambert	0.09	-1.56
Brandon Spikes	Brent Metcalf	0.88	-0.59
Brent Metcalf	Elizabeth Lambert	0.66	0.96

\* Indicates significant p-value (alpha level < .05)

### **Infantilizing**

The ANOVA for infantilizing was not statistically significant between the four athletes [ $F(3, 79) = .475, p = .701$ ]. Table 9 shows that all the athletes averaged between .5 and 1.35 instances of infantilizing per article. Because no significant differences were found, post hoc tests were not run. From this analysis, we fail to reject the null hypothesis, that there will be no difference between the athletes for infantilizing.

Table 9  
*Infantilizing by Athlete*

Athlete	Mean	Std. Deviation
Brittney Griner	1.22	2.93
Brandon Spikes	0.83	1.13
Elizabeth Lambert	1.35	1.90
Brent Metcalf	0.50	1.27

### **Non-Sports Related Characteristics**

The ANOVAs for non-sports related characteristics was not significant between the four athletes [ $F(3, 79) = 2.195, p = .095$ ]. Because no significant differences were found, post hoc tests were not run. From this analysis, we fail to reject the null hypothesis, that there will be no difference between the athletes for non-sports related characteristics.

Table 10

*Non-Sports Related Characteristics by Athlete*

Athlete	Mean	Std. Deviation
Brittney Griner	1.22	2.93
Brandon Spikes	0.83	1.13
Elizabeth Lambert	1.35	1.90
Brent Metcalf	0.50	1.27

## **CHAPTER V**

### **DISCUSSION**

#### **Summary**

The information from the results of the five one-way ANOVAs helped explain how the media writes about in-game violence in men's and women's Division-I games. The purpose of the study was to determine if there is a significant difference between newspaper articles published discussing a violent act in men's Division I sports and a violent act in women's Division sports.

#### **Descriptive Statistics**

Elizabeth Lambert was the only athlete with articles over one-thousand words. She had two articles printed in *The New York Times* there were over one-thousand words. The emphasis and space *The New York Times* dedicated to Lambert and her in-game violence is a definite deviation from previous research of Bruce (2008). The other three athletes did not have any articles over one-thousand words. The media showed a clear fascination with Lambert's in-game violence. This in part has to do with the extent of Lambert's in-game violence. She was the only athlete who had more than one instance of in-game violence and the official did not call any of the fouls until the second half.

Brittney Griner had the most articles written about her, which is also a deviation from previous research. Women's basketball traditionally does not receive the media attention of football. The media definitely showed a bias of reporting more about the women's in-game violence than the men's. Role congruity theory suggests this is due to society's

unwillingness to accept female in-game violence. This leads the media to report on the female in-game violence at a higher rate than the male in-game violence. Spikes averaged the most words per article, which is consistent with previous research (Bruce, 2008). Football and men's basketball have traditionally received the most media attention. This research shows that Spikes had, on average the longest articles of any of the athletes. This shows that the media spent the most space discussing the University of Florida's football team and Spikes' in-game violence. This is consistent with the previous research of Bruce (2008).

In the case of Brent Metcalf, a lower number of the articles was expected because wrestling is a niche sport and not as widely covered as football and women's basketball. What was unexpected was the amount of articles that were published about the Metcalf and his national championship match that failed to mention the shove. Ten articles were published discussing Metcalf's push, but nine more articles were published that did not mention the incident at all. Wrestling is an inherently physical and aggressive sport and some in the media may have felt that the shove was not out of the ordinary. But Metcalf's shove played an important role in his team's run for the team national championship. Metcalf was docked a point for unsportsmanlike conduct after he shoved his opponent in the national championship match ("Title Eludes Grasp," 2009). This point almost cost his team the national championship; the one point deduction put Ohio State University within 4.5 points of Metcalf's team. Iowa was able to hold onto their lead and with the team title, but it came down to the last day of competition ("Title Eludes Grasp," 2009). Perhaps if Ohio State had pulled off the victory by one point, more of the articles would have mentioned the shove.

Had the nine articles mentioned the shove, Metcalf would have had nineteen articles published, two more than Elizabeth Lambert's seventeen.

### **Article Trends**

An interesting trend is that Elizabeth Lambert was the only athlete to receive international coverage. The research methodology was limited to national newspapers, but LexisNexis Academic accesses international and national newspapers. In the case of Elizabeth Lambert, the researcher had to remove international articles. Articles discussing Lambert's violence were printed in two Canadian newspapers, the *Guelph Mercury* and *The Globe and Mail*. An article was also printed in *The International Herald Tribune*. An article featuring Lambert and her violence was even published in a Malaysian newspaper, the *New Straits Times*. The focus of the articles was Lambert's in-game violence, the Malaysian article was titled: "The Monster in Us All" and relates Lambert's violence to Malaysian politics and the vulnerability of man. Lambert's international coverage shows the unease and fascination the media has for flagrant in-game violence in women's sports.

The media covered Brittney Griner similarly to the male athletes. The focus of her articles was on the game she just played and the in-game violence was mentioned, but not the focus of the article. On the other hand, the articles written about Elizabeth Lambert focused entirely on the in-game violence. A reason for this could be race Brittney Griner is African American while Elizabeth Lambert is Caucasian. Previous research shows the media treats athletes differently based on their race. Messner et al. (1993) found that there was a racial bias in the television commentary of men's sports and that the media infantilized African American male athletes at a greater rate than Caucasian athletes. Previous research also shows that the media attributes African American athlete's success to "natural athleticism",

while success for Caucasian was credited to “intelligence and hard work” (Messner et al., 1993, p. 131.). In the case of this research, looking at in-game violence, race could have influenced the media. African Americans are at higher rates than other races for being victims, instigators, and witnesses of violence (Fitzpatrick & Boldizar, 1993). While both athletes were female and the instances of violence among females are much lower, race could have influenced how the media covered Brittney Griner’s in-game violence compared to Elizabeth Lambert.

There were differences among how the national newspapers and local newspapers covered the in-game violence for the athletes, especially in the case of Elizabeth Lambert. The two articles that ran in *The New York Times* had higher instances of establishing heterosexuality and sexualizing Lambert than any of the local newspapers. Both articles in *The New York Times* were written by Jere Longman. In these articles he was describing Facebook pages dedicated to Lambert, one of which described Lambert as a “sexy butcher” (“For All the Wrong Reasons,” 2009, p. B15). Longman also had an emeritus professor of social justice education, Pat Griffin, comment on the in-game violence and the Facebook pages and blogs that were written sexualizing Lambert. “It isn’t about women’s soccer and how great its players are, it’s about titillation, about sexualizing women in a catfight, that weird porno-lesbian sub-text: let’s watch two women go at it” (“For all the Wrong Reasons,” 2009, p. B15). The next article Longman wrote featured an interview with Lambert. In this interview Lambert discussed how upset she was that the violence was perceived as a “sexy catfight” and she was shocked that men sent her messages asking her out (“Those Soccer Plays,” 2009, B11).

The local newspapers did not focus on the blogs or the Facebook pages, which limited the sexualizing of Elizabeth Lambert in local papers. The majority of the local papers focused on the in-game violence and Lambert's suspension. The difference in the reporting styles of the national and local newspapers is concerning. When *The New York Times* articles were published it was the third most circulated newspaper in the United States with 951,063 daily readers. Females and young athletes read the articles written by Longman and the message being written is that women are being held to a different standard compared to the men. Anson Dorrance, UNC women's soccer coach who has coached the team to twenty national championships said, "The world has changed, women play with just as much intensity, work ethic and sometimes aggression as guys. But men can be celebrated for extreme aggression, like knocking out a quarterback in the N.F.L., women are held to different standard" ("For All the Wrong Reasons," 2009, B15). Longman's article reinforced the stereotype that the media sexualizes female athletes. Even though he was not personally sexualizing her, by reporting on it, he continues the trend on a national scale.

### **Research Question 1**

*Is there a gender difference in the content analysis of newspaper articles between athletes who engaged in in-game violent acts based on: a) gender marking, b) gender typecasting, c) established heterosexuality, d) infantilizing, e) non-sports related characteristics?*

The only difference in the reporting of in-game violence between men and women Division I athletes was gender marking. Gender marking was prevalent among articles discussing the female athletes. Table 11 shows that gender marking occurred on average 2 times per article for both Brittney Griner and Elizabeth Lambert, while it happened less than .1 times per article for Brandon Spikes and Brent Metcalf. This is due to part to the



fact that football and wrestling do not have a female counterpart, which limits the need to identify which team is playing. Brittney Griner and Elizabeth Lambert played basketball and soccer, respectively and both of these sports have male counterparts, thus their teams were identified as the “women’s basketball team” and “women’s soccer team”.

Griner played for Baylor, whose mascot is the ‘Bears’. The media referred to the basketball team in all the articles coded as the ‘Lady Bears’. Lambert played for New Mexico, whose nickname is ‘Lobos’ and articles referred to the soccer team as the ‘Lobos’. This is consistent with previous research by Messner et al. (1993), who specifically looked at gender marking during the 1989 Men’s and Women’s Final Four basketball Tournaments. The media still refers to women’s sports teams as the ‘women’s basketball team’ or ‘women’s soccer team’ and identifies men’s teams as the ‘football team’ and ‘wrestling team’. The continued usage of gender marking by the media is concerning because repetitive gender marking continues to contribute to the male dominance with sports and trivializes women’s sports (Messner et al., 1993).

## **Research Question 2**

*Is there a difference in the content analysis of newspaper articles between athletes of the same gender who engaged in in-game violent acts based on: a) gender marking, b) gender typecasting, c) established heterosexuality, d) infantilizing, e) non-sports related characteristics?*

The results show the media reports on women’s violence differently, in the categories of gender typecasting and establishing heterosexuality. Gender Typecasting showed a significant difference between the female athletes, but not between the sexes or the male athletes. Every article discussed a violent incident, since violence is traditionally

considered masculine, masculine words were used in every athlete's articles (Fields et al., 2007). These include "Griner took offense and threw a punch at Barncastle, which caught the sophomore's face and nose, causing a frenzy on the court as both benches cleared" ("Baylor's Griner Suspended," 2010). Every article discussed the athletes emotions. Emotions are traditionally considered a feminine trait (Messner et al., 1993). All the athletes or their coaches apologized for the violence, citing emotions as one of the reasons the violence occurred. Elizabeth Lambert released the following statement "My actions were uncalled for; I let my emotions get the best of me in a heated situation" ("Those Soccer Plays," 2008, p. 11). In the case of Elizabeth Lambert, emotions were a common theme in articles written about her, which led to her gender typecasting coding numbers to be higher than the rest of the athletes researched.

The type of in-game violence impacted the gender typecasting. Brittney Griner punched an opponent in the face and broke her nose. Punching is considered masculine, while slapping and hair pulling, in the case of Elizabeth Lambert is considered feminine (Fields et al., 2007).

This is the first research that compares female athletes to each other as well as male athletes. This current research shows a change from Messner et al. (1993) research. Messner et al. (1993) found that females were gender type-cast at a much higher rate than male athletes. This current research does not support those findings, but there are several reasons for this. Messner et al. (1993) analyzed television commentators for the NCAA Men's and Women's Final Four and the U.S. Open. Television commentating is mostly unscripted and is reactionary to what is occurring at the moment (Messer et al., 1993). This research analyzed newspapers articles and the newspaper journalist had time to

analyze the game, the events during the game, and then write about it. The journalists had more time to plan out what they were going to write and could avoid gender typecasting.

Establishing heterosexuality was also significantly different between Elizabeth Lambert and Brittney Griner. Lambert was the only athlete who was discussed in a sexual manner. A video was played on "The Late Show with David Letterman" that showed Lambert's in-game violence with a sexy male voiceover. Lambert's in-game violence was also compared to a "sexy catfight between two women" ("Those Soccer Plays," 2009, p. 11). Lambert also received sexual messages from men asking her out and wanted to learn more about her sexual aggression ("Those Soccer Plays," 2009, p. 11). Similarly to gender typecasting, the type of in-game violence may influence whether the media sexualizes female athletes. Brittney Grinner punched an opponent in the face and broke her nose. Elizabeth Lambert pulled an opponent's hair and slapped her, upon other offenses. The slapping and hair-pulling can be related to sexual fantasies, while punching does not have the same correlation. There is a link between sexual aggression and violence (Fields et al., 2007). The results show that depending on the in-game violence that occurs in a female sport, the media may react differently to violence in female sports based on socially constructed gender roles.

Previous research found that the media was slowly ending the practice of sexualizing female athletes (Messner et al., 1993; Wensing & Bruce, 2003). The current research shows that the media has not completely stopped sexualizing female athletes. It is a practice that is still occurring and one that continues to trivialize and degrade female athletes.

### **Research Question 3**

*Is there a lack of a difference found in the content analysis of newspaper articles between athletes, regardless of gender, who engaged in in-game violent acts based on: a) gender*

*marking, b) gender typecasting, c) establishing heterosexuality, d) infantilizing, e) non-sports related characteristics?*

Infantilizing and non-sports related characteristics did not report a significant difference between any of the athletes. The majority of the infantilizing only occurred in quotes from athletes or coaches. In quotes the coaches referred to their athletes by their first names and Griner and Lambert's coaches referred to them as 'young ladies'. But the journalist never referred to any athlete by just their first name, it was either their first and last name or last name only. This is a change from the research of Messner et al. (1993) and Wensing and Bruce (2003). In those studies the media commonly referred to the female athletes by their first name only. Wensing and Bruce (2003) researched articles about Cathy Freeman during the 2000 Sydney Olympics and they reported she encouraged some infantilizing by referring to herself as a 'girl' (Wensing & Bruce, 2003, p. 393). The current research finds this is still occurring among women's sports. Female athletes and their coaches will refer to themselves or players as young ladies, allowing the media to use these words.

There was also no significant difference for non-sports related characteristics among the four athletes. The only instances of non-sports related characteristics occurred when athletes or coaches were apologizing for the in-game violence and cited their life outside of athletics. Elizabeth Lambert's teammate released a statement "Elizabeth is a compassionate, kind and good person ... and the [media] portrayal is in no way indicative of her character." ("Their Lips Are Sealed," 2009, p. 1). The findings from this research are consistent with the previous research of Wensing and Bruce (2003).

## **Recommendations**

The schools are enabling the usage of gender marking by identify their female teams differently than their male teams. In the case of gender marking, it is not just the media perpetuating the issue. If there is any hope of the media changing the trend of gender marking in reporting, schools need to start calling all their teams sports teams the same nickname. The athletes and coaches gender marked at a high rate in quotes in the articles. The athletes and coaches need to understand that gender marking trivializes women's sports and these athletes and coaches need to be empowered. Until the schools and their coaches and athletes stop the trend of gender marking, the responsibility of gender marking cannot be held with the media.

The sports information departments can also use these findings. Understanding how the media will react to in-game violence, especially if the media is going to sexualize an athlete, is important information for sports information to know. The sports information departments can prepare athletes for the potential media outburst, as well as prepare press releases prior to the media's reactions.

This research can also be helpful to the media. The media appears to report on in-game violence differently and newspaper reporters may not be aware this is occurring. This research brings to light the differences that occur in the media. The media may be unaware of these differences or believe they are reporting in an unbiased manner, especially when reporting on female in-game violence. The media has the ability to make the changes to report on all athletes in a similar and unbiased manner.

### **Future Research**

Further research should be completed to expand the study to determine if these results are typical for male and female athletes, or are specific to the four athletes researched for this

study. Expanding the study to five years and ten male and ten female athletes would give a much larger sample size.

It would also be helpful to expand to digital media and television. By examining how the media on the internet, including articles and webcast, discuss violence would also be useful. People are beginning to consume more information on their smart-phones, computers, and tablets and less people are relying on newspapers for their daily media. Also researching commentators discussing the violence would be helpful. Watching games where in-game violence occurs and listening to the commentators and the news stories would help deepen this research. Newspapers are only one source of media and analyzing other sources would help given a broader perspective of how the media reacts to in-game violence.

Another area of research would be to examine how the media reports on in-game violence and the race of an athlete. This research showed the media reported on in-game violence differently for a black female and a white female. Future research could determine if this is a recurring theme.

## Appendix A

### Coding Protocol for Violent Incidents in College Sports by Genders

- 1) Articles in the top 20 Newspapers in circulation should be coded as a national newspaper.

These newspapers include:

1. The Wall Street Journal
2. USA Today
3. The New York Times
4. The Los Angeles Times
5. The Washington Post
6. Dailey News
7. New York Post
8. San Jose Mercury News
9. Costa Times
10. The Oakland Tribune
11. Chicago Tribune
12. Houston Chronicle
13. The Arizona Republic
14. Philadelphia Inquirer
15. Philadelphia Dailey News
16. Newsday
17. The Denver Post
18. Star Tribune
19. St. Petersburg Times

20. Chicago Sun-times

- 2) Articles that come from a different newspaper than the 20 listed above will be considered regional or local newspapers. No international newspapers should be coded.
- 3) Only Articles that occurred within a four month span of the violent incidents should be coded.
  1. Brittney Griner – Punch Occurred on Wednesday, March 3<sup>rd</sup> 2010, Code from 3/3/2010 to 7/3/2010
  2. Brandon Spikes- Eye Gouge Occurred on Saturday, October 31<sup>st</sup> 2009, Code from 10/31/2009 to 2/28/2010
  3. Elizabeth Lambert – Hair Pulling Occurred on Thursday, November 5<sup>th</sup> 2009, Code from 11/5/2009 to 3/5/2009
  4. Brent Metcalf – Push Occurred on Saturday, March 21<sup>st</sup> 2009, Code from 3/21/2009 to 7/21/2009
- 4) If an Associated Press article appears in more than one newspaper, code it and count it for all the Newspapers it appears in on the Codebook.
- 5) The coding for each Newspaper article includes five categories, descriptions for how to determine and code for each category is described:
  1. **Gender Marking** – occurs when sports are distinguished by the genders, example women’s soccer and men’s tennis. Gender marking does not occur, if the sport is referred to as football or basketball and gender is not mentioned.
  2. **Gender Typecasting**- Occurs when articles discuss a female or male athlete’s traditional traits. For females this includes being small, beautiful, graceful,



emotional, unstable, lovely, and kind. A male athlete's traditional masculine traits include being strong, fast, confident, explosive, dominant, arrogant, aggressive and muscular.

3. **Establishing Heterosexuality** – Occurs when men or women in the articles are referred to as sexual objects or are discussed in a heterosexual manner, as a husband, wife, boyfriend, girlfriend, or as a father or mother.
4. **Infantilizing** – Occurs when the media refers to successful athletes as a boy, girl, young man, young lady, or by referring to athletes by their first name only.
5. **Non-Sport Related Characteristics** – Occurs when the focus of the article moves away from the athlete and the sport and discusses family, relationships, appearance and personality

## Appendix B Codebook Variables

Coders should go through the following steps in the content analysis for each of the articles included in the study (v = variable)

### v1. Coder identification

1 = Elizabeth Lancaster

2 = Helen Lancaster

### v2. Athlete

1 = Britney Griner

2 = Brandon Spikes

3 = Elizabeth Lambert

4 = Brent Metcalf

### v3. Identification of Newspaper

1 = Top 20 National Newspaper

The Wall Street Journal

USA Today

New York Times

Los Angeles Times

The Washington Post

Dailey News

New York Post

San Jose Mercury News

Costa Times

The Oakland Tribune  
Chicago Tribune  
Houston Chronicle  
The Arizona Republic  
Philadelphia Inquirer  
Philadelphia Dailey News  
Newsday  
The Denver Post  
Star Tribune  
St. Petersburg Times  
Chicago Sun-times

2= Regional Newspaper

v4. Date of Article Publication (month, date, year [i.e., March 9, 2009 would be coded as 3/9/09])

v5. Words per article

v6. Gender Marking – number of times it occurs per article

v7. Gender Typecasting – number of times it occurs per article

v8. Establishing Heterosexuality – number of times it occurs per article

v9. Infantilizing – number of times it occurs per article

v10. Non-Sports Related Characteristics - number of times it occurs per article

## REFERENCES

- Berelson, B. (1952). *Content analysis in communication research*. Glencoe, IL: Free Press.
- Bredemeier, B., Shields, D., Weiss, M., & Cooper, B. (1967). The Relationship Between Children's Legitimacy Judgments and Their Moral Reasoning, Aggression Tendencies, and Sport Involvement. *Sociology of Sport Journal*, 4, 48-60.
- Bruce, T. (2008). Women, Sport and the Media: A Complex Terrain. In C. Obel, T. Bruce & S. Thompson (eds), *Outstanding Research About Women and Sport in New Zealand* (pp. 51-71). Hamilton, New Zealand: Wilf Malcolm Institute of Educational Research.
- Bryant, J. (1980). A two-year investigation of the female in sport as reported in the paper media. *Arena Review*, 4, 32-44.
- Conroy, D., Silva, J., Newcomer, R., Walker, B., & Johnson, M. (2001). Personal and Participatory Socializers of the Perceived Legitimacy of Aggressive Behavior in Sport. *Aggressive Behavior*, 27, 405-418.  
doi:10.1002/ab.1026
- Craig, Susanne. (2000, March 10) Internet Turns up Heat on Newspapers. *The Globe and Mail*, M1.
- Daddario, G. (1994). Chilly Scenes of the 1992 Winter Games: The Mass Media and the Marginalization of Female Athletes. *Sociology of Sport Journal*, 11, 275-288.
- Diekman, A. B., & Eagly, A. H. (2000). Stereotypes as Dynamic Constructs: Women and Men of the Past, Present, and Future. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, 26, 1171-1188.  
doi: 10.1177/0146167200262001
- Diekman, A., & Goodfriend, W. (2006). Rolling with the Changes: A Role Congruity Perspective on Gender Norms. *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, 30, 369-383.  
doi: 10.1111/j.1471-6402.2006.00312
- Drew, J. (2009, November 13). BYU Soccer: Their Lips are Sealed in New Mexico over Player's Rough Play. *The Salt Lake Tribune*.

- Dyer, G. (1987). *Women and television: An overview*. New York: Pandora Press.
- Duncan, M. C. (1990). Sports photographs and sexual difference: Images of women and men in the 1984 and 1988 Olympic Games. *Sociology of Sport Journal*, 7, 22-43.
- Eagly, A. H., Johannesen-Schmidt, M., C., & van Engen, M., L. (2003). Transformational, Transactional, and Laissez-Faire Leader Styles: A Meta-Analysis Comparing Women and Men. *Psychological Bulletin*, 4, 569-591.  
doi: 10.1037/0033-2909.129.4.569
- Eagly, A.H., & Karau, S. J. (2002). Role Congruity Theory of Prejudice Toward Female Leaders. *Psychological Review*, 109(3), 573-598.  
doi: 10.1037//0033-295X.109.3.573
- Eleuze, R., & Jones, R. L. (1998). A Quest for Equality: A Gender Comparison of the BBC's TV Coverage of the 1995 World Athletics Championships. *Women in Sport and Physical Activity Journal*, 7, 45-67.
- Fields, S., Collins, C., & Comstock, R. (2007). Conflict On the Courts: A Review of Sports-Related Violence Literature. *Trauma Violence Abuse*, 8, 359-369.  
doi: 10.1177/1524838007307293
- Fields, S., Collins, C., & Comstock, R. (2009). Sports Related Violence: Hazing, Brawling, and Foul Play. *British Journal of Sports Medicine*. Published online: October 25, 2009.  
doi: 10.1136/bjism.2009.068320
- Fitzpatrick, K. & Boldizar, J. (1993). The prevalence and consequences of exposure to violence among African-American youth. *Journal of the American Academy of Child and Adolescent Psychiatry*, 32, 424-430.  
doi: 10.1097/00004583-199303000-00026
- Garcia-Retamero, R., & López-Zafra, E. (2006). Prejudice against Women in Male-congenial Environments: Perceptions of Gender Role Congruity in Leadership. *Sex Roles*, 55, 51-61.  
doi: 10.1007/s11199-006-9068-1
- Gershel, J.C., Katz-Sidlow, R.J., Small, E. & Zandieh, S. (2003). Hazing in suburban middle school and high school athletes. *Journal of Adolescent Health*, 32, 333-335.  
doi: 10.1016/51054-139x(03)00021-1
- Graydon, J. (1983). But it's more than a game: It's an institution. *Feminist Review*, 13, 5-16.

- Hoover, N.C. (1999). *National survey: Initiation rites and athletics for NCAA sports teams*. Retrieved July 20, 2010, from [http://www.alfred.edu/sports\\_hazing/docs/hazing.pdf](http://www.alfred.edu/sports_hazing/docs/hazing.pdf)
- Hoover, N.C., & Pollard, N.J. (2000). *Initiation rites in American high schools: A national survey*. Retrieved July 20, 2010, from [http://www.alfred.edu/hs\\_hazing/](http://www.alfred.edu/hs_hazing/)
- Just, D. (2010, March 5). Baylor's Griner is Suspended for Two Games. *Lubbock Avalanche-Journal*.
- Kirk, D. (1993). *The body, schooling and culture*. Geelong, VIC: Deakin University Press.
- Longman, J. (2009, November 11). For All The Wrong Reasons, Women's Soccer is Noticed. *The New York Times*, pp. B15.
- Longman, J. (2009, November 18). Those Soccer Plays, in Context. *The New York Times*, pp. B12.
- Lombard, M., Snyder-Duch, J., & Bracken, C. C. (2002). Content Analysis in Mass Communication. *Human Communication Research*, 28, 587-604.
- Melnick, M. L., & Jackson, S. J. (1998) The villains as reference idol: Selection frequencies and alien attributes among New Zealand teenagers. *Adolescence*, 33, 543-554.
- Messner, M. A., Dunbar, M., & Hunt, D. (2000). The Televised Sports Manhood Formula. *Journal of Sport and Social Issues*, 24, 380-394.  
doi: 10.1177/0193723500244006
- Messner, M.A., Duncan, M. C., Jensen, K. (1993). Separating The Med From the Girls: The Gendered Language of Televised Sports. *Gender & Society*, 7, 121-137.  
doi: 10.1177/089124393007001007
- Milne, M. J., & Adler, R. W. (1999). Exploring the Reliability of Social and Environmental Disclosures Content Analysis. *Accounting, Auditing, and Accountability Journal*, 12, 237-256.  
doi: 10.1108/09513579910270138
- Nagel, M.S., Southall, R.M., & O'Toole, T. (2204). Punishment in the four major North American professional sports leagues. *International Sports Journal*, 8, 15-27.

Pirinen, R.M. (1997). The Construction of Women's Positions in Sport: A Textual Analysis of Articles on Female Athletes in Finnish Women's Magazines'. *Sociology of Sport Journal*, 14, 283-301.

Shields, E. W. (1999). Intimidation and Violence by Males in High School Athletics. *Adolescence*, 34, 503-521.

U.S. Bureau of the Census. (2000). *Current population reports: Educational attainment in the United States: March 2000* (Table 1: Educational attainment of the population 15 years and over, by age, sex, race, and Hispanic origin). Retrieved June 8, 2010, from <http://www.census.gov/population/socdemo/education/p20-536/tab01.txt>

Weiller, K.H., & Higgs, C.T. (1999). Television Coverage of Professional Golf: A Focus on Gender. *Women in Sport and Physical Activity Journal*, 8, 83-100.

Wensing, E. H., & Bruce, T. (2003). Bending the Rules: Media Representations of Gender During an International Sporting Event. *International Review for the Sociology of Sport*, 38, 387-396.  
doi: 10.1177/1012690203384001