

Lisbeth Wells-Pratt. "Buildings Built with Dirty Silver": Joint-use and the Carnegie Libraries of Western Pennsylvania. A Master's Paper for the M.S. in L.S degree. April, 2013. 37 pages. Advisor: Barbara B. Moran

This paper explores the legacy and continued importance of joint-use libraries within the context of two early Carnegie Libraries at Homestead and Braddock, Pennsylvania. It argues that Andrew Carnegie's philanthropic efforts in the Pittsburgh region are cogent historical examples of successful joint-use libraries in the midst of challenging economic, political, and demographic turmoil.

Headings:

Joint-use libraries

Carnegie libraries – History

Libraries & labor – History

Libraries & community -- History

**“BUILDINGS BUILT WITH DIRTY SILVER”: JOINT-USE AND THE CARNEGIE
LIBRARIES OF WESTERN PENNSYLVANIA**

BY
Lisbeth Wells-Pratt

A Master’s paper submitted to the faculty
of the School of Information and Library Science
of the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of Master of Science in
Library Science.

Chapel Hill, North Carolina

April, 2013

Approved by:

Barbara B. Moran

Introduction

The Carnegie Library of Homestead, Pennsylvania sits on a stately hill, on a tree-lined street, overlooking the Monongahela River. Three miles south on the banks of the Monongahela is the town of Braddock. Together, these two towns formed the backbone of the Carnegie Steel Works, earning the sobriquet of “steel towns” and becoming inextricably linked to the steel manufacturing empire of Andrew Carnegie that focused around the city of Pittsburgh. They are also among the first recipients of an Andrew Carnegie Library. Between 1883 and 1929, Carnegie donated money to build over 1,500 libraries in the United States alone (Bobinski 299), but he had a special interest in donating libraries to the Pittsburgh region. While most of Carnegie’s libraries were simply that – traditional book lending libraries – the libraries at Homestead (1896) and Braddock (1889, expansion in 1893) represent Carnegie’s commitment to building joint-use facilities for the populations he had the most vested interest in. In his mind, these towns formed not only the geographic heart of his manufacturing empire but also contained a population that Carnegie believed required enlightenment of the mind, body, and spirit. Carnegie came to view his libraries at Homestead and Braddock as an opportunity to nurture all three of these requirements, in a model he came to call the “Three Fountains” whose “healing waters” pursued the goal of providing “instruction, entertainment, and happiness for the people” (Goldberg 151). In this form, Carnegie’s Three Fountains make a compelling argument for the importance of joint-use library

facilities, and the libraries at Homestead and Braddock merit analysis for the way they compose the most direct instantiation of Carnegie's vision for joint-use libraries.

Carnegie's philosophical – and philanthropic – commitment to joint-use libraries in the municipalities he turned into “steel towns” came at a price. In the Homestead and Braddock communities Carnegie and his philanthropic efforts were a bitter pill for many steelworkers, who toiled upwards of 16 hours a day in his steel mills (Jewel 152).

Carnegie's critics, especially proponents of the labor movement, saw Carnegie's efforts as an attempt to repent for his treatment of labor unions within his mills (Krause 53).

Homestead was the scene of a bloody strike in 1892, and the contentious labor issues created an atmosphere of suspicion and skepticism towards Carnegie's Three Fountains model.

Yet these concerns also provide more evidence for the importance of studying Carnegie's libraries in Homestead and Braddock as cogent examples of joint-use libraries in the midst of challenging economic, political, and demographic turmoil. Immigrant populations in both towns found a cultural touchstone within the library's Music Hall, and it soon served an important role as the center of culture within the communities themselves. In their one hundred-plus years of existence, the Carnegie Library Music Halls at Braddock and Homestead have hosted highly eclectic performances: from violinists and organists, to thespians and orators, as well as Communist leaders, ghost hunters, labor unions, the “Godmother of Punk”, and Andrew Carnegie himself. The Carnegie Library Music Halls were, and remain, an important piece of Andrew Carnegie's enduring legacy of philanthropy in service of supporting joint-use libraries in communities facing difficult labor, economic, and cultural obstacles. This paper argues

for Carnegie's Three Fountains model as a vital articulation of the importance of joint-use libraries in communities riven by these challenges, and suggests that the continued use of the Homestead and Braddock libraries in contemporary times shows the necessity of our understanding how these libraries came into being.

The Beginning of a Librarian

Well before he made his millions, Andrew Carnegie played a small role in creating our modern conception of a free community library. He also developed an early association of libraries with other cultural institutions in a community. Born in Scotland in 1835, Carnegie emigrated with his family to Allegheny, Pennsylvania in 1848. His first job was as a bobbin boy, where he replaced spools of thread at a local cotton mill (Carnegie 298) for 72 hours a week. Two years later, at fifteen, Carnegie began working for twice the money he had been previously making by becoming a messenger boy for the Ohio Telegraph Company. As a telegraph messenger Carnegie enjoyed the perks of free admission to the local theater, where his interest in theatre – especially William Shakespeare -- was kindled (Carnegie 300). Years later, an article in the *New York Times* would note “it was his love for Shakespeare that first roused his [Carnegie's] mind to thoughts above the anvil” (“Endowing Dramatic Art At the Box Office”) introducing him to the power of cultural institutions. Carnegie would credit this exposure to theatre as one of his first opportunities for the young teenager (working more than full time) to expand his mind and introduce him to something more than labor.

The columnist goes on to note an apparent oddity, though: “Did he show his gratitude to Shakespeare by proclaiming that the way to patronize him was to buy of the publishers? Not he! He established libraries”. As much as Carnegie enjoyed attending the

local theatre, the avid reader had no access to a local lending library. He could see Shakespeare, but could not read the text. As the *New York Times* noted, “for him, Shakespeare was a book.” Even today, a statue of Shakespeare stands as one of four avatars of culture outside of the flagship Carnegie Music Hall in Oakland, Pennsylvania. The Bard stands as a representative of literature, not performance (Bach) or art (Michelangelo). Books and literature became the focal point of young (and old) Carnegie’s vision of cultural experience. During his tenure at the Ohio Telegraph Company, Carnegie heard that War of 1812 hero and business Colonel James Anderson had over 400 books in a private lending library, and immediately visited on the two days the library was open to “working boys”, Wednesdays and Sundays (Goldberg 151). Much to his dismay, he was not “entitled” to use the library for free: because Carnegie was only a telegraph messenger and thus not truly a boy who “worked with his hands,” he was expected to pay \$2.00 a year to borrow books from Colonel Anderson’s library (Carnegie 15, Goldberg 151). Incensed, Carnegie wrote a letter to the Pittsburgh Dispatch in defense of his “working boy” status, urging Colonel Anderson to include working boys without professional trades in his free lending policy. This early advocacy for the vitality of a library foreshadowed Carnegie’s commitment to a library serving the entirety of a population rather than an “elite” segment. It also speaks to Carnegie’s view that because a library provides an opportunity for the “working boys” to improve themselves, a library serves an important function for both the community and its employers. Andrew Carnegie’s first engagement with the public was a success: Colonel Anderson expanded the lending policy to those in Carnegie’s situation. Carnegie never forgot this, and put a

plaque indebted the free library movement in Western Pennsylvania to Anderson in front of the Carnegie Free Library at Allegheny (Goldberg 151).

In 1864, Carnegie invested in a farm in Venango County, Pennsylvania, and he made over a million dollars from oil wells and petroleum production. After the Civil War, his interests turned towards ironworks. Carnegie's business acumen and interest in maintaining business relations, coupled with the development of the inexpensive Bessemer and Siemens-Martin Processes of producing steel, propelled him to the top of his "Empire of Steel." In 1901, he sold his empire to J.P. Morgan for \$300 million dollars – and became the richest man in the world. (Goldberg 152). As he became fabulously wealthy, Carnegie also became increasingly enmeshed in the lives of towns across Pennsylvania and the country. Entire communities became Carnegie towns, flooded with immigrants and others seeking employment and hoping to follow the model of the telegraph boy from Scotland. More than a success story, Carnegie became one of the models of the Gilded Age's narrative of rags to riches, the embodiment of the American dream who now had reached the pinnacle of success.

As such, Carnegie felt the power of his wealth quite acutely, and in 1889 penned the line "the man who dies rich, dies disgraced." There are many motives for Carnegie's turn towards philanthropy in his later years. As a man who spent much time entertaining wealthy friends, he saw the realities of wealth in the hands of the very few (Carnegie 105). As he outlines in his 1889 essay "The Gospel of Wealth," there were three ways to get rid of wealth. First, wealth can be bequeathed to heirs, but Carnegie observes that this sort of wealth is often squandered away with the frivolities of riches and power. Second, bequeathing wealth to a public charity comes with no guarantee that this wealth will be

used wisely, or in accordance with one's wishes. Third, wealth can be distributed charitably during one's lifetime. This final option is what Carnegie believed was the most efficient and effective way to charitably donate, in the hopes of producing and sustaining economic and cultural wealth within one's lifetime. It intertwines economic success with exposure to cultural institutions, and asserts the greatest impact on a community comes from the provisions of these two forms of "wealth." Conveniently, this approach would also support the communities upon which his own manufacturing empire relied. Thus, there seemed no better place to sustain this economic and cultural wealth than the region that bequeathed the labor force that had made Carnegie his fortune. The challenge, though, was that Carnegie's tactics to build this fortune had made his name an anathema to the very communities he hoped to foster. His belief in the cultural and economic value of joint-use library came into direct conflict with the emerging socio-economic and demographic challenges initiated by his own labor policies.

The Case for Libraries at Homestead and Braddock

The Homestead Strike was one of many labor actions that occurred in the United States near the turn of the last century. The U.S. economy was winding up for the Panic of 1893, and Carnegie's steel mills were not immune to the downturn. The price of steel had declined steadily since 1890, from \$35 a ton to \$22 a ton by January, 1892 ("The American Experience: The Homestead Strike"). The manager of the Homestead mill, Henry Clay Frick, sought to decrease wages for the 3,800 workers, as well as dissolve their union, the Amalgamated Association of Iron and Steel Workers. Carnegie supported Frick's plans to decrease wages, break the union, and instructed him to begin producing

as much steel as possible, in case there was a possible work stoppage. If the union did not accept the terms of the new contract, including the dissolution of the Homestead branch of the Amalgamated union, Carnegie would allow Frick to shut down the plant until the workers compromised.

When workers did not agree to the terms of the new contract, Frick locked the union members out of the mill. He was unwilling to negotiate further, despite the Amalgamated concessions to everything with the exception of the dissolution of their union. A month into this second round of negotiations, Carnegie departed for his annual vacation to Scotland and could not be reached by the union members. In the past, he had been a staunch supporter of the right to unionize, but left the workers to negotiate with Frick only. In his letters to Frick, Carnegie discussed that there were far too many workers required by the union contract for the amount of jobs available at the mill, and that he believed workers would rather hang on to their jobs, than attempt to preserve their membership in the Amalgamated Association of Iron and Steelworkers. Carnegie was very aware that his steel mills essentially ran the towns they were located in, and that for many workers, their jobs within the mill were the only thing keeping their families from destitution.

Carnegie and Frick were caught off guard when 3,000 workers, far more than the union's membership of 750, voted to strike instead of accepting Frick's final contract negotiation. The unionized workers at the Duquesne mill and deunionized workers at the Edgar Thomson Works mill in Braddock joined the Homestead workers, and shut down their plants in solidarity. An enraged Frick ordered a three-mile fence, dubbed "Fort Frick", to encircle the empty Homestead mill for property protection, as well as to keep

the workers out of their former place of employment. When local police were brought in to guard the mill, they didn't stay long – the workers intimidated them into leaving. This act of defiance, guarding the mill they were supposed to be driven from, Pittsburgh historian Paul Krause attributes to the workers' feeling of a collective stake in the operations of the mill (Krause 98). They were not simply Carnegie's workers at his Homestead mill – they *were* the Homestead mill, they built their livelihoods around the facility just as much as the facility based its livelihood around them.

As the strike dragged on for weeks, a desperate Frick ordered the Pinkerton Detective Agency's well-armed private army to forcibly take back the mill from the ever-present workers. This was to be a tricky operation that Frick believed could only be accomplished by sneaking up on the mill, in the middle of the night, on the Monongahela River. The plan was set into motion, but not without a hitch: the workers had positioned night watches along the river to detect any potential invaders.

Late in the night, workers spotted the private army, rifles and all, coming slowly down the river. They sounded the alarm by horseback to the people of Homestead, and thousands of the striking workers and their supporters went down to the river to intercept the arriving Pinkerton barge. Many in the swelling crowd were Homestead residents, but they were soon joined by their neighbors from Braddock and Duquesne. All three towns had a collective stake in the outcome of the labor action, for it would set the tone for interactions between labor, Andrew Carnegie, and his steel town communities, for many years to come.

When the Pinkertons finally landed at Homestead mill, they were met by an armed line of union members who warned them to not step off of their barge for their

own safety. There is no record of who fired the first shot. Under a barrage of gunfire and open conflict, the Pinkertons were forced back to their barge, where they waited. For the next 14 hours, there was a stalemate between workers on the riverbanks and the Pinkertons on the river. During the 14th hour, the Pinkertons surrendered, but the damage had already been done: three Pinkerton guards and nine workers were dead. In the wake of this bloody scene, the Pennsylvania state government could no longer stand by.

The state militia was ordered to Homestead, and they were far better armed than the Pinkerton Detective Agency. They took over the facility, and brought outside strikebreakers in to staff the mill. The formerly unionized, thoroughly defeated, and certainly enraged Homestead workers returned to their jobs four months later. Those who were leaders within the Amalgamated union during the strike were charged with murder, and several union members were arrested for treason. None of them were convicted by the region's heavily pro-labor juries. In the end, Frick, with Carnegie's backing, successfully removed unions from their Pittsburgh mills. Andrew Carnegie's reputation in these areas was never quite the same. Carnegie broached the topic of Homestead in his autobiography, and stated "nothing...in all my life, before or since, wounded me so deeply" (301). For the people of Homestead, and in the communities of Braddock and Duquesne, the wounded feeling was mutual. Thus, it was in the shadow of the events of Homestead, that Carnegie enacted his plans to endow libraries to the region.

Giving away his wealth was no small task. In fact, it was difficult to give anything away in Western Pennsylvania if it were related to Andrew Carnegie. After the Homestead Strike, public sentiment was not on the side of the steel magnate, particularly in a steel town such as Pittsburgh. As noted by several researchers, "as early as 1888, it

seemed clear that Carnegie's generosity was closely connected to victories over organized labor." Indeed, Braddock, Pennsylvania's library was underwritten the year after Carnegie's Thomson Steel Works' forced workers to sign into a deunionized "partnership" with Carnegie – the same partnership that workers at Homestead died fighting three years later.

There has not been extensive research done into Carnegie's explicit motives for bringing libraries to the Pittsburgh region in particular, though he certainly reserved his earliest and grandest libraries for the region in which Carnegie Steel was the major employer (Miner 107). Homestead and Braddock's future as a community was inescapably tied to the success, or failure, of Carnegie's enterprises. By and large, his company was the only game in town. Most workers worked long, twelve-hour days and did not engage with books, music, or other leisure activities (Goldberg 160), and Carnegie thought his philanthropic efforts could bring great riches to those who worked in his mills, even if those riches were not material. In this way Carnegie's belief in the interrelation of economic and cultural wealth provides the logic behind the creation of libraries in the very communities that he had just fought over economic benefits. If Carnegie was unwilling to provide financial concessions, he believed his workers would nonetheless draw equivalent cultural benefits from his libraries, much as he did as a young boy. With these objectives in mind, Carnegie set out to build his first American library in Braddock in 1889. Four libraries followed, Allegheny (1890), Pittsburgh/Oakland (1895), and Homestead (1896). Of the four libraries, all except for Allegheny continue to operate as a library today (Carnegie denied).

From the beginning, labor issues and demographics made the libraries at Braddock and Homestead special cases that add to their value as case studies for joint-use library facilities. Each served a primarily working class population, of whom, in 1890, 30.7% were foreign-born (Encyclopedia Britannica, 11th edition). Most of the immigrants from the region were from Eastern European countries, but the 1921 fire within the U.S. Commerce Department has destroyed much of the 1890 census records from the Pittsburgh region. The 1900 census cites 21,222 German, 18,620 Irish, 6,243 Russian Polish, 5,709 Italian, 3,553 Austrian, and 3,515 German Polish immigrants in the Pittsburgh census tract. (Encyclopedia Britannica, 11th edition) This large population of foreign-born residents represented a challenge for Carnegie familiar to librarian officials today: how to build a library for the “community”, and a diverse community at that. Carnegie envisioned a cultural institution that would provide for everyone in these communities – just as he advocated for Colonel Anderson to open his library to all boys. The libraries, when built, were to become the center of the community, the “jewel[s]” on the hill that would provide cultural, if not economic, wealth to all members of these immigrant and labor-heavy towns (Goldberg 155). From the start, Carnegie’s libraries meant to address multiple needs of these communities, and to foster the sort of cultural engagement he envisioned as concomitant to economic development.

Carnegie’s labor practices, though, meant he faced initial opposition to his philanthropy in the region. Though he had given a library to Braddock in 1889, he did not expand the facility to include athletic facilities, a larger library, and a music hall, until after the Homestead Strike, in 1893. The library at Homestead was anticipated even before the Homestead Strike (Miner 110). During the Braddock dedication in 1889,

Carnegie expanded on how “anxious” he was to give Homestead a library, if they would only enter a “partnership” with him. This “partnership” was the sliding scale of wages and the breaking of their union that followed the Homestead Strike. Indeed, there was an inextricable link between the library and his relationship to the workers who lived in the town. The difference, though, was that while Carnegie viewed this as a positive opportunity to offer cultural experiences for his workers (akin to the opportunities he had fought for as a teenager), for the workers themselves this relationship was purely a negative decline in their economic fortunes. The cultural benefits were obviated by the perceived financial costs of a “partnership” with Carnegie, and parts of the community rejected the exchange.

Clearly, these benefits came with a price tag. One of the largest considerations involved in the building of libraries at Homestead and Braddock was how the library would be financed. At the same time Carnegie began financing his philanthropic efforts, local governments were attempting to acquire the legal right to raise money through local taxation. Much of the union criticism of Carnegie came from this angle – as he required towns who were to receive a library to support upkeep – but the libraries at Braddock and Homestead were funded mostly by Carnegie himself. (Goldberg 160). Carnegie’s willingness to provide maintenance and utilities at these joint-use libraries again speaks to his perception in the importance of these institutions for the entire community with which Carnegie wished to form a “partnership.” Repairs of the buildings were provided for free by staff from Carnegie’s mills, and the company covered utilities and budget overruns. This earned the Carnegie Steel Company a stake in the operating board of the

library itself, and symbolized the symbiotic relationship between the company, the community, and the functions of the library.

The symbolism was not lost on a labor movement that wished to disentangle its members' lives from Carnegie's control. In 1892, a meeting of the American Flint Glass Workers' Union was held to take action regarding the library Carnegie wanted to build in the city of Pittsburgh. Some union members accused Carnegie of reducing the wages of workers simply to pay for the libraries, and another union member declared that he would "sooner enter a building built with the dirty silver of Judas Iscariot got for betraying Jesus Christ than enter the Carnegie Library" (Hubbard 9). Such vitriol indicates the level of resistance to the Carnegie Libraries, and provides one important lesson from this historical moment. Despite the many financial and cultural benefits that Carnegie attempted to link to the construction of the libraries, political suspicion was enough to undermine some of his efforts. The zealotry of the union member's objection reminds us of the importance of building community support for any library, and that the institution of the library does not exist in a political vacuum. What is more, the member's words suggest that despite Carnegie's apparent efforts to tie his library construction to labor victories, these benefits of the library could not overcome the political wounds created by his conflicts with labor unions. This speaks to the limitations of the value of libraries as instruments to tie a community together and overcome previous grievances. Indeed, in the 33 years following the christening of the first Carnegie Library in the United States, 20 of 46 Pennsylvania towns offered a library ended up rejecting the offer (Krause, 138).

Carnegie's reaction to these rejections was detailed in an 1897 letter to Herbert Spencer. In paternalistic terms, Carnegie argues: "they knew not what they did, and so

rendered only more steadfast, if possible, in my determination to give them precious gifts. Never, have halls, libraries, museums, and art galleries roused the masses of a city to such enthusiasm” (Hubbard 10). There is a note of pride in Carnegie’s tone, as though his libraries have already succeeded by inciting a reaction from the community that far outpaces any other response to a cultural institution. In another letter to Spencer, Carnegie referred to the Braddock library as a purchased satisfaction, “a great satisfaction, one of the greatest I have ever acquired” (Krause 132). Carnegie saw these libraries as an investment designed to make a major impact on their communities, akin to the steel mills and oil refineries he purchased across Pennsylvania that made him the wealthiest man in the country. In these terms, then, Carnegie articulates a place of honor for libraries in a community alongside the economic engines of his “steel towns,” the cultural and financial centers that he found great satisfaction in acquiring.

The Building of Three Fountains

Carnegie’s comparison of the library to other cultural institutions was apt, for he envisioned what we now call joint-use and community-centered library services. According to modern scholars Bundy and Amey (502), the synergy of joint-use libraries rests in their ability to be “greater than the sum of the parts”. Their uses are vast, and their advantages are varied, but they essentially “enhance social capital through increased community engagement”. Carnegie, ever business-minded, understood this and viewed the enhancement of both monetary and social capital as his fundamental philanthropic goals. The spirit of these early Carnegie libraries is resonant in the development of library science as a discipline, from the 1907 development of Utah’s “State Library and

Gymnasium Commission” (“State Library Comissions” 167), to modern library literature on the importance of evaluation methods of community-centered and joint-use library services. Carnegie was invested in providing a library that catered to the “Three Fountains”. The first of these fountains is the mind, which the library was to inform. The second of these fountains is the body, which sought recreation within the gymnasium and swimming pools. The third of these fountains is the spirit, which was to be fostered by the Music Hall. The idea to combine these abstract desires of the human soul into one joint-use facility consisting of a library, athletic club, and music hall, is said to have come from Carnegie’s advisors as a way to repair Carnegie’s image in Homestead after 1893 strike (Goldberg 162, Miner 111). This three-pronged approach to providing community services was considered a “morality of self-improvement”, which would provide for the “moral, physical, and social wellbeing of the working man” (Miner 112).

During his the dedication speech at Homestead in 1898, Carnegie elaborated on these fountains, and to what ends he hoped his library would serve.

“The Library, filled with the most precious legacy the past can bequeath to the present—a collection of good books. To educate the people of this community by supplying readable literature to the masses of the people, making a provision for the student, encouraging societies formed for self-culture, supplementing the world of the public schools.

The Club: How a man spends his time at work may be taken for granted, but how he spends his hours of recreation is really the key of his progress in all the virtues. To provide a place where one may occupy his time in systematic physical development, in amateur athletics, in healthful games and profitable intercourse.

Music Hall: Here you will have your entertainments and meetings for education and philanthropic purposes. To contribute toward the ethical and moral spirit of the community by providing a meeting place for free musicals and entertainments, a suitable hall for public gatherings” (Miner 112).

In many ways, Carnegie envisioned his libraries as an extension of his stake in the overall culture of the Carnegie Steel Works. He provided his workers with a place to

work, as well as a place to intellectually grow. Carnegie viewed his libraries as an “emblem of peace, reconciliation, mental confidence, harmony and union” (Miner 112) between labor and capital, a “temple of education and knowledge”, and an example that the company was bestowing upon workers the “fruits of their labor”.



Fig.1 Carnegie Library in Braddock, 1893 – “Braddock Carnegie Free Library addition, Braddock, Pennsylvania”, Library of Congress, Washington, DC.

The actual structures of Carnegie’s libraries also testified to his belief in creating an institution on par with any cultural or economic generator of wealth. In 1889, at a cost

of \$500,000 (Goldberg 154), the Braddock library was completed. The rock-faced grey sandstone library building was designed by William Halsey Wood of Newark, NJ (National Register of Historic Places). The design itself is a Romanesque revival, not unlike the Smithsonian Institution Building in Washington, D.C. The 1893 addition was designed by Longfellow, Alden, and Harlow of Boston, MA., and Pittsburgh, PA (National Register of Historic Places). With the 1893 addition came a doubling in size of the building itself, as well as a gymnasium, a swimming pool located beneath the Music Hall, and a two-lane duckpin alley (interesting, a variant of duckpin bowling called “Rubber Band Duckpins”, emerged exclusively from the industrial Monongahela river corridor in 1909 (Harmon 115). There were also billiard tables on the first floor, along with the library collection and the heavily-used children’s sections. In another gesture of Carnegie’s paternalism towards his workers, he had a bathhouse in the basement for workers to shower before they accessed the facilities. There were various rooms throughout the library in which meetings or classes could be held, and where later language and penmanship classes were held for local immigrants. The grandest part of the facility, however, was the 964-seat Music Hall. The ceiling was domed and the upholstery richly colored, but most grand of all was the pipe organ, donated by Carnegie himself.

These elements were mirrored by the library at Homestead, though recorded in more thorough detail in the historical record. It took nearly 10 years after ground was broken at Braddock to build a library for Homestead. In 1896, ground was broken for the Homestead Library on the exact site where the state militia set up camp during the Homestead Strike. The construction was undertaken over a period of two years, and when

it was finished, was an expanse of 60,000 square feet at a cost of \$300,000 (Goldberg 155). This construction pleased Carnegie to such a degree that he wrote to business partner Henry Clay Frick to announce that he might potentially announce his retirement at the dedication ceremony (he did not) (155). Homestead consisted of a library with an expanded children's section, a gymnasium with an elevated indoor jogging track, twelve baths, two bowling alleys, an indoor swimming pool which hosted Olympic swimmers, nine card tables, a billiard and pool room with eight tables, and a Music Hall with 1,100 seats. The building was designed by Pittsburgh architects Frank Alden and Alfred Harlow, and was located on a tree-lined street surrounded by large houses that overlooked the river: houses that were owned mostly by managers at the Homestead Works. (Miner 120). The building itself experienced much grandeur from its enormity, establishing not only a monolithic cultural presence in the area, but a monolithic physical presence as well.



Fig.2 Carnegie Library of Homestead, 1900 – “Carnegie library of Homestead, Munhall, Pennsylvania”, Library of Congress, Washington, DC.

The dedication ceremonies at both Braddock and Homestead reflected Carnegie’s desire to provide “a suitable hall for public gatherings”, by hosting them within the Music Hall. At the dedication ceremony at Homestead, over 1,500 invitations were issued for the formal dedication. Many of these invitations went to the families of steelworkers, though industrialists Henry Phipps, Henry Clay Frick, and Charles M. Schwab also were in attendance. Schwab, speaking at the formal ceremony, noted: “I believe the workmen

and all the people of Homestead fully realize the great value of Mr. Carnegie's gift and the spirit which prompted its inception". (Goldberg 156). There was an extensive procession march to mark the occasion of the dedication, which lasted for hours despite adverse weather. Of such a magnitude were the celebrations that 17 year-old Charles Wakefield Cadman composed "The Carnegie Library March" to mark the occasion. His self-published composition sold 6,000 copies, and Cadman later went on to be one of Hollywood's top score composers in the 1920s, and became one of the most popular American composers of the 1930s. From their inception, the Music Halls at the Carnegie Libraries of Braddock and Homestead have inspired hundreds of musicians and patrons of the arts and live performance. Herein lies perhaps the most important – as well as the greatest irony – of the Carnegie libraries in the Pittsburgh area. Although Carnegie himself initially posited the importance of books as central to his vision of improving cultural and financial wealth, it was these large halls that ultimately became the most dynamic aspects of his joint-use Three Fountains libraries. Perhaps unwittingly, Carnegie had created a space where a community confronting the very demographic and political challenges he had helped to create would be able to gather and create a new sense of community beyond Carnegie's control. It is this legacy of Carnegie's Three Fountains philosophy – found in the Music Halls rather than the book stacks – that illustrates the importance of joint-use libraries in diverse and economically challenged communities to this day.

Early uses of the Music Hall

The Music Hall at both libraries filled a void that had been previously filled by the Grand Exhibition Music Hall at the Point in downtown Pittsburgh. The Grand Exhibition Music Hall was a space for music festivals that was built in 1889, before being turned into a garage in 1893 after the economic downturn of 1893. The libraries at Homestead and Braddock provided a place for secular, but still moral, entertainment. Estranged from the vaudevillian tendencies of the day, the Music Hall was intended to be a place of intellectual reflection and self-improvement. Carnegie was aware of the extent of his workers' leisure time, and the conflict between spending free time at his library, versus a religious institution, was documented in Carnegie's autobiography. In reference to the lack of progressive views held by religious officials in the Pittsburgh area, Carnegie wrote:

“[...]these same ministers have recently been quarreling in their convention at Pittsburgh upon the subject of instrumental music in churches. But while they are debating whether it is right to have organs in churches, intelligent people are opening museums, conservatories, and libraries upon the Sabbath; and unless the pulpit soon learns how to meet the real wants of the people in this life (where alone men's duties lie) much better than it is doing at present, these rival claimants for popular favor may soon empty their churches” (150).

And they did. In an 1897 edition of the “Nebraska State Journal”, Willa Cather mused about the revolution in Sunday leisure time that Carnegie libraries might orchestrate. In regards to the organ recitals held by Frederic Archer at the Carnegie Library in Pittsburgh (Oakland), Cather stated “it is probable that people will go down to the Carnegie on Sunday afternoon and drink in the depraving melodies of Bach and Schumann and Haydn for years to come.” . One minister stated his opinion that "ethically, an organ recital on the Sabbath was just as depraving as a minstrel show”.

Despite this pushback against the Sunday organ recitals within the library Music Halls, attendance was booming. Head librarian of the Homestead library (1902-1942), William F. Stevens, was meticulous in recording usage statistics of his library's services. In one year of free organ recitals, over 32,000 patrons attended a performance at the Music Hall. The historical record points to the nature of organ recitals being not unlike Pittsburgh Steelers games to the present-day inhabitants of the Pittsburgh region. Both recreational activities stake out their own unique niche in the fabric of Pittsburgh culture.

Organ music makes up a significant chunk of the musical heritage of the Pittsburgh area. Pipe organs were so popular during Carnegie's lifetime that he donated over 7,000 of them to churches, societies, and libraries. ("Pittsburgh is the City of Organ Recitals"). In 1899, Edwin Votey, inventor of the Player Piano and owner of the Votey Organ Company, was commissioned to build two nearly-identical organs for the Braddock and Homestead libraries. Each organ cost \$10,250 (Stark 10). Across the river, at the Carnegie Library of Pittsburgh (Oakland), the British-born composer and organist Frederich Archer was hired to be the music director at the Music Hall. Another example of Carnegie's foresight as far as music and culture is concerned is demonstrated in this response to Archer's hiring as a "town organist" in a city "short of the first class", as expressed in an editorial of *Music* in 1895 (510). The editor opined, "It will be his duty to play recitals twice a week, and probably to perform other musical duties. The experiment of the organ recitals will be watched with interest[...]I do not believe that a taste for serious organ music or an appreciation of the place of organ music in art will ever be formed by such means."

Archer played 451 recitals in the span of five years, and attendance at organ recitals was much the same at the Allegheny branch, as well as Homestead and Braddock. Perhaps one of the greatest legacies of the organs Carnegie donated to his libraries lives on in the music of Ethel Smith, Pittsburgh native and organist extraordinaire. Born in 1910, Smith studied with Caspar Koch, the organist at the Carnegie Library of Allegheny. Smith went on to become the “Empress of the Hammond”, the electric organ of the same name. In 1941 she became the organist at the Copacabana Casino in Rio De Janeiro, and in 1943 began playing for “Your Hit Parade”. Her pop sensibilities and technical organ skills, and her roots at the Carnegie Library of Allegheny and Carnegie Institute, are a testament to the success of Carnegie’s joint-use venture.

It was not only musical selections that brought audiences to the Carnegie Library Music Halls in the early years, but ethnic music festivals also began to fill the schedule.

One of the first major events held within the Homestead Library’s Music Hall was the “Grand Eisteddfod”, which was sponsored by the Music and Literary Society of Homestead. The first Grand Eisteddfod was held in 1898, the year of the dedication of the library. The Grand Eisteddfod was a celebration of the musical and literary cultural traditions of Wales, at a time in which there was a significant Welsh population in the region. There were prizes for the best musical compositions and scores submitted by contestants, as well as a poetry contest. The top prize for poetry of the first Grand Eisteddfod went to John Bevan, for his poem “The Carnegie Library and Its Donor”, presumably praising the philanthropic efforts of Carnegie and the majesty of the library itself. The Grand Eisteddfod continued as an annual event at the Music Hall in subsequent years.

The 1910s saw a surge in the use of the music hall for immigrant-initiated activities, including special musical events and celebrations. The growing Italian, Polish, Ukrainian, and German populations that lived in the neighborhoods of the Monongahela's industrial corridor used the Music Hall with such frequency that Homestead's Head Librarian concluded that, after all, music was the "only universal language" (Miner 122). The winter months of the 1910s saw the Music Hall being used to show movies in order to undercut what was perceived by the librarians as a "gang spirit" of the children of millworkers (Miner 116). Children were heavy users of books at the library, and therefore many library activities were geared towards younger patrons. The Music Hall boasted a string class of over 125 students, a children's chorus of over 140 members, as well as adult choruses and a performance band. A 1918 singing competition held at the Homestead Music Hall launched the career of a young Maxine Sullivan, considered one of the best jazz vocalists of the 1930s (Friedwald 170), another example of the influence of these libraries in the careers of major musicians of the 20th century.

The Music Halls at Braddock and Homestead were not used solely for music and movie purposes – they also served as a large meeting hall for community activities. During the 1930s, the libraries hosted night study clubs where high school graduates and nongraduates alike attended classes taught by volunteering teachers, on subjects from trigonometry to drama. The entire school was given "an appropriate and inspirational address each week" at the Music Hall. (Goldberg 163). The textbooks for these courses were funded through plays and other performances put on at the Music Hall. The ability to fund activities through the use of an in-house Music Hall provided opportunity for many in the community who might not have received these services otherwise.

Lectures were frequently given in the Music Hall, and speakers from the nearby Carnegie Institute would visit Carnegie Library Music Halls with frequency. Politicians also visited these venues to achieve a higher profile on the community level, but their visits were not always made without controversy. In 1928, the Carnegie Library at Allegheny denied members of the Communist Workers Party the opportunity to use the Music Hall as a venue for a rally to introduce their candidate for President of the United States, William Z. Foster. The Head Librarian, Clifford B. Connelley, thought allowing the Workers to use the Hall would be “most unwise” as it might bring about “disorder”. (“Hall Refusal Before Council”). The Workers solicited the Labor party, and quickly began to circulate a petition to use the hall, which was not granted.

The place of politics within the Carnegie Library has always been a controversial topic, and in the years following the 1893 Homestead Strike, it was particularly so. It took 44 years before a labor leader was to speak in either the Homestead or Braddock Music Halls. In 1937, a representative for the Steelworkers Organizing Committee was the first labor leader to speak at the Carnegie Library at Homestead (Miner 118). Feeney Busarello was the public face of the union, which formed a year earlier in 1936. This substantiated labor’s place in the political landscape of the post-depression years, and represented a departure from the culture of Andrew Carnegie’s steel enterprises in the late 19th and early 20th centuries: the magnate died in 1919.

Decline in Use

The late 1920s and early 1930s were a difficult time for many institutions in the United States, but both libraries maintained operations and ensured that quality

programming was available in their facilities. The Braddock Library did not experience severe financial difficulties until the 1960s, when a leaking roof and a loss of an endowment forced the library into closure. Around the same time, and into the 1970s, the Homestead library (which always boasted more usage than Braddock), was examining their own financial viability. The steel industry was rapidly in decline, and the library was not as supported financially by U.S. Steel as they had been during the era of the Carnegie Steel Works. However, the library was spared from closing in the 1980s because of the financial support of U.S. Steel after the closing of the Braddock and Duquesne branches of the Carnegie libraries. The Music Hall was still used, despite poor lighting, and retained its grandeur of earlier times. In Braddock, however, the Music Hall fared far worse.

After the library had been acquired by the Braddock School District in 1961, its Music Hall was used for high school drama productions. When funds ran out in 1974 the library and Music Hall sat dormant for 8 years until it was purchased by the Braddock's Field Historical Society after a grassroots effort by the last Braddock librarian, David Solomon, and local residents. ("Lights Go Up Again"). Their \$1 purchase yielded a library and Music Hall stricken by years of abandonment. The Votey organ had been torn from the walls and presumably scrapped, there was significant damage to the Hall's wooden floor, as well as the building's roof. After years of renovation, and a \$450,000 restoration of the Music Hall, the Braddock Library Music Hall is returning to its roots as a cultural centerpiece.

Reclamation and Reuse

The Braddock Library's Music Hall is now undergoing further restorations to the floor, as well as a complete overhaul of the venue's seats. It has hosted the Quantum Theatre Company, a "found space" company from the Pittsburgh area who frequently use industrial and abandoned buildings to stage their works. The Music Hall, with its glamorous turn-of-the-century design, retains the quiet dignity of a Carnegie Library. The library continues the restoration of the Music Hall and hopes to host musical events in the future. The building, both inside and out, has been featured in several cinematic productions. The library most recently served as a museum and a gymnasium in the 2010 movie "6 Souls", or "Shelter", directed by Måns Mårland and Björn Stein (IMDB).

The Homestead Library is now a financially independent arm of the Carnegie Library system in Pittsburgh. The Music Hall has been updated to fully employ the acoustic possibilities of the space, and retains the original Votey organ in nonworking condition. The organ has not been played since 1949, and a 2003 restoration figure was estimated at \$800,000 (PG article), not within the library's budget. An original Steinway large parlor grand piano bestowed upon the library in 1899 also remains and is used daily. The piano is a source of some speculation, as it has an inscription on its sound board that states "To His Majesty, The King of Prussia, 1879" ("Play It, Henry Frick?"). The exact origin of the piano is not known, but it was long presumed to be purchased by Andrew Carnegie and donated anonymously. Years after the donation, library records revealed that it had been purchased and donated anonymously by Henry Clay Frick, the notorious manager at the Homestead Works during the 1893 strike. These "ghosts" of the

Homestead Strike are not strictly limited to Carnegie-era instruments and décor in this Music Hall.

In 2011, a team of paranormal investigators from the Syfy Channel show “Ghost Hunters” visited the Carnegie Library at Homestead to investigate a “library built on bloodshed” (“Ghost Hunters”). The team was particularly concerned about the potential of Andrew Carnegie’s ghost haunting the building, or the ghost of the workers killed in the 1893 strike. The paranormal flying books were the least of the crew’s worries when a loud sound in the Music Hall scared the ghost hunters. The investigators concluded that “some sort of activity” was occurring in the library, but certainly “nothing threatening”. While no ghosts were found, the legacy of the library’s past continues to “haunt” visitors, all while raising money for the library, during a sponsored “Ghost Tour” during the Halloween holiday.

Perhaps the most lasting impact on the local culture the library has, both economically and intellectually, is the continued use of the Homestead Library Music Hall as a venue for popular music. In 2006, Dan Lloyd, chair of the library’s 11-member board, began work with Brian Drusky, a local concert promoter, to bring popular musical acts to Homestead. Lloyd attributed this move to his inspiration following his attendance at a nonprofit leadership seminar about the ways “community benefit” organizations can economically thrive. The library, founded more than 110 years previously, found yet another way to connect with and benefit the local community. In 2007, the “Godmother of Punk”, Patti Smith, was the first rock and roll artist to perform at the venue. Known for her poetic flair and exuberant performances, Smith was right at home in the classically designed Hall. During her set, Smith seemed almost reverent regarding the elegance of

the library, musing “I can’t believe you can actually play in a library. Two of the greatest things to do in one place – play music and read”. (“Patti Smith Show Burns Hot”) Since the inaugural performance in the renovated Music Hall in 2007, dozens of concerts have taken place. From folk singer and son of the famed protest singer-songwriter Woody Guthrie, Arlo Guthrie, to comedian Bill Maher, the library continues to provide a venue for creative expression in a community shaped by industry and the philanthropy of Andrew Carnegie.

Conclusion

Andrew Carnegie’s legacy as a philanthropist extends far past the institutions he founded, charities he funded, and the libraries that he built. His influence in the way libraries are purposed and accessed can be felt even today. From their beginnings in the Carnegie Steel towns of Braddock and Homestead, Pennsylvania, Carnegie’s libraries have been representative of the way joint-use facilities can become a cultural touchstone within a diverse population. They also represent the extent to which Carnegie sought to repair his image in the Pittsburgh region following the deadly 1893 Homestead strike.

That these donations took place in the context of cultural and political turmoil remains inescapable, and also provide the most vivid example of why these libraries remain important markers in the history of joint-use libraries. Carnegie envisioned a library model that would compensate – and indeed heal and improve – a community that had seen blood spilled and remained deeply skeptical of anything with Carnegie’s name attached to it. Yet the donation of a facility that served what Carnegie described as the “Three Fountains” of “instruction, entertainment, and happiness” quickly made these

public libraries a cultural nexus within a population that had much antipathy towards its donor. From this perspective, Carnegie's belief in the importance of libraries serving multiple uses seems validated. Although it is impossible to predict how the communities of Homestead and Braddock would have reacted if Carnegie had elected to build single-use libraries in these communities, the evidence suggests that Carnegie felt a joint-use model would have a greater chance of success. "Success," in this model, means the fulfillment of his Three Fountains model, but also the sustainability of a library that serves a diverse community.

By examining the use of the community music hall within Carnegie libraries at Homestead and Braddock, we see a legacy of this joint-use model that continues to this day. In a sense, the role of community music halls at these libraries testify that Carnegie was indeed correct to envision joint-use libraries as able to provide instruction, entertainment, and happiness to a community that – on the surface – is riven by political, economic, and social divisions. If we take the example of Homestead and Braddock to heart, then further attention needs to be given to the importance of joint-use libraries in communities that could be seen as akin to Homestead and Braddock to this day. Of course caution is needed not to adopt the paternalistic attitude that Carnegie clearly exhibited to these communities, but the fact remains that his libraries remain a compelling case for a century-long legacy of joint-use library facilities. Homestead and Braddock provide validation for any library service seeking to articulate how joint-use facilities provide a community with both short and long-term benefits. We would do well to find ways to incorporate Carnegie's Three Fountains into our further studies of joint-

use libraries, and to keep the examples of these two towns in Western Pennsylvania in mind as we explore the value of joint-use libraries across the nation and world.

Bibliography

- Allison, Andrea. "Ghost Stories: Carnegie Library of Homestead." *Ghost Stories* 29 Sept. 2011. Web. 14 Mar. 2013.
- American Library Association. "State Library Comissions." (1910): 167. Print. *Library Journal*.
- Besler, Ann. "Lights Go up Again." *Pittsburgh Post-Gazette*. 19 Oct. 2006. Web. 23 Apr. 2013.
- Bobinski, George S. "A Call for Preservation — of a Carnegie Library." *Libraries & Culture* 24.3 (1989): 367–369. Web. 23 Feb. 2013.
- . "Carnegies." *American Libraries* 21.4 (1990): 296–303. Web. 23 Feb. 2013.
- Brown, Matthew, and Elizabeth Galand. "Ethel Smith: Weird Organ Lady or Mondo Organista?" *Theatre Organs*. Web. 16 Mar. 2013.
- Bundy, Alan L., and L. J. Amey. "Libraries Like No Others: Evaluating the Performance and Progress of Joint Use Libraries." *Library Trends* 54.4 (2006): 501–518. Print.
- Carnegie, Andrew. *Autobiography of Andrew Carnegie*. Ed. John Charles Van Dyke. 2006. Web. 14 Mar. 2013.
- Cather, Willa. "Pittsburgh Organ Woes." *Organ Atlas* (2010): 125. Print. Rpt. of "Pittsburgh Organ Woes." *Nebraska State Journal*. 17 Jan. 1897.
- Corbin, John. "Endowing Dramatic Art At the Box Office; Mr. Andrew Carnegie on Shakespeare in the Library, the University, and the Theatre." *The New York Times* 20 Mar. 1904. Web. 23 Apr. 2013

- Friedwald, Will. *A Biographical Guide to the Great Jazz and Pop Singers*. 1st Edition. Pantheon, 2010. Print.
- Goldberg, Martin. "Books, Billiards, and Bowling: Joint-Use According to Carnegie." *American Libraries* 30.11 (1999): 50–53. Web. 23 Feb. 2013.
- . "The Jewel of the Valley: The Carnegie Library of Homestead." *Pennsylvania History* 70.2 (2003): 149–173. Web. 23 Feb. 2013.
- Harmon, John E. "Bowling Regions of North America." *Journal of Cultural Geography* 6.1 (1985): 109–124. Web. 14 Mar. 2013.
- Hubbard, Elizabeth Ann. "Library Service to Unions: A Historical Overview." *Library Trends* 51.1 (2002): 5–18. Print.
- Johanningsmeier, Charles. "Welcome Guests or Representatives of the 'Mal-Odorously Class'? Periodicals and Their Readers in American Public Libraries, 1876-1914." *Libraries & Culture* 39.3 (2004): 260–292. Web. 23 Feb. 2013.
- Krause, Paul L. "Patronage and Philanthropy in Industrial America: Andrew Carnegie and the Free Library in Braddock, Pa." *Western Pennsylvania History* 71.2 (1988): 127–146. Print.
- Lord, Robert Sutherland. "The First Carnegie Organ." *Organ Atlas* (2010): 62–67. Print.
- Mervis, Scott. "Concert Review: Patti Smith Show Burns Hot in Library Music Hall." *Pittsburgh Post-Gazette*. 2 Aug 2007. Web. 16 Mar. 2013.
- 6 Souls*. Dir. Måns Mårilind and Björn Stein. NALA, 2010. Film.
- McCrossen, Alexis. "'One Cathedral More' or 'Mere Lounging Places for Bummers'? The Cultural Politics of Leisure and the Public Library in Gilded Age America." *Libraries & Culture* 41.2 (2006): 169–188. Web. 23 Feb. 2013.

- Mickelson, Peter. "American Society and the Public Library in the Thought of Andrew Carnegie." *The Journal of Library History (1974-1987)* 10.2 (1975): 117–138. Web. 23 Feb. 2013.
- Millen, Irene. "Andrew Carnegie's Music Library." *Notes* 22.1 (1965): 681–690. Web. 23 Feb. 2013.
- Miner, Curtis. "The 'Deserted Parthenon': Class, Culture and the Carnegie Library of Homestead, 1898–1937." *Pennsylvania History* 57.2 (1990): 107–135. Web. 23 Feb. 2013.
- Pinel, Stephen L. "Early Jardine Organs in Pittsburgh." *Organ Atlas* (2010): 34–43. Print.
- "Pittsburgh Is the City of Organ Recitals." *Eleventh Stack*. Web. 14 Mar. 2013.
- "Play It, Henry Frick?" *Pittsburgh Post-Gazette*. Web. 24 Feb. 2013.
- Public Broadcasting Service. "The American Experience: The Homestead Strike." *PBS.org*. 2004.
- "Rebirth in Homestead: The Carnegie Library." *Pittsburgh Post-Gazette*. Web. 23 Apr. 2013.
- "Rockin' and Rollin' at the Carnegie Library Homestead." *Pop City*. Web. 24 Feb. 2013.
- Slyck, Abigail A. van. "'The Utmost Amount of Effectiv [sic] Accommodation': Andrew Carnegie and the Reform of the American Library." *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians* 50.4 (1991): 359–383. Web. 23 Feb. 2013.
- Smith, Rollin. "Pittsburgh's Millionaires and Their Organs." *Organ Atlas* (2010): 70–79. Print.
- Stark, James M. "Carnegie Library of Homestead." *Organ Atlas* (2010): 148–149. Print.

---. "Pittsburgh Organ History: The Other Carnegie Music Halls." *The Tracker* 53.4

(2009): 8–12. Print.

The Pittsburgh Press. "Hall Refusal Before Council." *The Pittsburgh Press* 19 Oct. 1928 :

23–23. Print.

U.S. National Parks Service. "National Register of Historic Places." Web. 23 Feb. 2013.

Walker, Sophia Antoinette. "The Carnegie Library, Pittsburg.: Four Buildings in One--

Carnegie's Great Gift." *The Independent ... Devoted to the Consideration of
Politics, Social and Economic Tendencies, History, Literature, and the Arts*

(1848-1921) 14 Nov. 1895 : 6. Print.